



Evaluation of the Flagship Qur'an Memorization Program Using the Countenance Stake Model: Challenges and Opportunities for Development

Ashri Nafiah Nur Isti Qomah¹, Muhammad Rafif Yuliza Absa¹, Muhammad Iqbal Al Fatih¹,
Junita Evie Puhan¹, Istanto¹, Muh Nur Rochim Maksu¹

¹Faculty of Islamic Studies, Muhammadiyah University of Surakarta, Indonesia

*Corresponding Author: Ashri Nafiah Nur Isti Qomah

Email: o100250016@student.ums.ac.id



Article Info

Article history:

Received 5 December 2025

Received in revised form 3

February 2026

Accepted 25 March 2026

Keywords:

Program Evaluation

Tahfidz

Countenance Stake Model

Al-Qur'an Learning

Madrasah Ibtidaiyah

Abstract

This study aims to evaluate the implementation of the Superior Tahfidz Program at MI Muhammadiyah Tahfidzul Qur'an Matesih using the Countenance Stake Model which assesses three main components, namely antecedent, transaction, and outcome. The evaluation was conducted to determine the level of program readiness, the suitability of the implementation process with the planning, and the achievement of results obtained through Tahfidz activities. Data collection was carried out through documentation, observation, interviews, and review of student memorization achievements, which were then analyzed descriptively through a comparison between intents and observations according to the structure of the evaluation model. The study results indicate that the Superior Tahfidz Program has a clear planning basis, adequate institutional support, and a curriculum structure that supports the formation of a Qur'anic culture in madrasas. During the implementation phase, the program ran fairly consistently with its initial objectives, although several challenges were still encountered, such as variations in student abilities, limited learning time, and the need to improve the capacity of Tahfidz teachers. Meanwhile, the outcome component shows that the program has a positive contribution to the development of memorization and religious character of students, although its effectiveness depends on the continuity of guidance and strengthening collaboration between teachers, madrasas, and parents. Further analysis revealed opportunities for program development, particularly through improved learning methods, the use of supporting media, and strengthening the memorization evaluation system.

Introduction

The Tahfidzul Qur'an program plays an important role in Islamic education, as it maintains the purity of the verses of the Qur'an while instilling spiritual values in students (Marwah, Hamid, Tamwif, Afidah R, & Amelia A, 2023) . In the context of modern education, the Tahfidz program is not only understood as a religious activity, but also as a means of character formation, cognitive development, and instilling discipline and moral values (Nahdia, Zubaidillah, & Azmi, 2023; Sugandi, Kulkarni, Mulyana, Haedari, & Casta, 2025) . Therefore, many educational institutions, especially Islamic educational institutions such as madrasas, make Tahfidz a flagship program to balance the academic and spiritual achievements of students (Zainuddin, 2024; Setiawan et al., 2025; Ramadani & Rohman, 2025).

However, the implementation of the Quran memorization program in various educational institutions still faces various challenges (Abdullah et al., 2019; Abdullah et al., 2021; Al Arifi et al., 2026). Problems such as limited learning time, differences in student memorization abilities, and a lack of competent teaching staff often hinder the achievement of memorization targets (Rahmad & Syamsul Hadi, 2024) . Furthermore, the absence of a standard evaluation

system often results in Quran memorization programs running without clear and targeted performance indicators (Thontawi et al., 2022; Amirudin et al., 2025). This situation creates an urgent need for an evaluation model that not only assesses the final results but also examines the process and context of the program's implementation as a whole (Zhang et al., 2011; Ferdinan & Pewangi, 2025; Aziz & Amir, 2025; Kip et al., 2025).

One evaluation model considered relevant is the Countenance Stake Model (Purwati & Arifin, 2023; Wiedemann et al., 2024; Telaumbanua et al., 2023). This model focuses on three main components: antecedent (context and planning), transaction (implementation process), and outcome (results and impact of the program) (Stake, 1967). This model allows researchers to map the relationship between program planning and implementation, while also providing a more comprehensive picture of the program's strengths and weaknesses (Ziyyad Alafthoni, 2024). Thus, the Countenance Stake Model not only serves to assess program effectiveness but can also assist program improvement through systematic feedback (Noor et al., 2025; Rachmaningtyas, 2025; Sarigöz & Kudret, 2025).

Several studies have discussed the evaluation of Quranic memorization programs using various models, such as CIPP and Countenance Stake. Among them, research conducted by (Azizah & Lisnawati, 2022; Inu Aulia Arba et al., 2024) shows that the Countenance Stake model provides a comprehensive step in assessing the antecedent, transaction, and outcome components of Quranic memorization programs at the elementary and secondary school levels. Meanwhile, (Pratiwi, Cahyana, & Ahmad, 2025) emphasizes the importance of governance and quality management in Quranic memorization programs in educational institutions, one of which is through the application of the CIPP model. However, there is still a research gap regarding the application of the Countenance Stake model in superior Quranic memorization programs, especially at the Islamic elementary school level (Rahma, 2025; Munif, 2025; Ramadani & Rohman, 2025).

MI Muhammadiyah Tahfidzul Qur'an Matesih is an elementary school that prioritizes the memorization program as its primary identity (Ribath & Astutik, 2025; Yusuf et al., 2025; Fatmawati & Amaliah, 2025). Despite its relative infancy, the number of students continues to increase annually, demonstrating the high level of public trust in the quality of the Qur'an memorization program provided by this school. Furthermore, the increasing number of students also creates an urgent need for a more structured management and evaluation system to ensure the quality of memorization and learning (Rahmawati, Anwar, Wathoni, & Maromi, 2023).

Based on the description, this study aims to evaluate the implementation of the Superior Tahfidz Program at MI Muhammadiyah Tahfidzul Qur'an Matesih using the Countenance Stake Model. The focus of the study is directed at identifying challenges and opportunities in three main components of the evaluation, namely: antecedent, transaction, and outcome, in order to obtain a comprehensive picture of the effectiveness of program implementation. Theoretically, this study is expected to enrich the literature on the application of the Countenance Stake-based Islamic education evaluation model, while practically, the results are expected to provide strategic recommendations for madrasah managers in improving the quality, efficiency, and sustainability of the Tahfidzul Qur'an program in elementary education institutions. Thus, this study is expected to contribute to the development of an Islamic education evaluation model as well as become a practical reference for similar institutions in improving the quality of the Tahfidzul Qur'an program.

Methods

This study uses a qualitative approach with a case study approach to evaluate the implementation of the Superior Tahfidz Program at MI Muhammadiyah Tahfidzul Qur'an Matesih. This approach was chosen because it allows researchers to understand the phenomenon in depth in a real-world context and interpret the meaning behind the processes and experiences of the research subjects (Creswell & Creswell, 2018) .

The evaluation model used is the Countenance Stake Model developed by (Stake, 1967) . This model assesses a program through three main components: antecedent (context and planning), transaction (implementation), and outcome (results and impact). This approach is considered appropriate for evaluating this Qur'an memorization program because it emphasizes the interrelationship between design, implementation, and overall program results.

The research was conducted at MI Muhammadiyah Tahfidzul Qur'an Matesih, Karanganyar Regency, Central Java. The subjects included the principal, the person in charge of the tahfidz program (mas'ul tahfidz), and several students directly involved in the memorization activities. Subjects were selected purposively, considering their significant involvement in the program's implementation (Tajik, Golzar, & Noor, 2025) .

The research data was obtained from two sources: primary and secondary data. Primary data was collected through in-depth interviews, observations of tahfidz learning activities, and a review of documentation related to program implementation. Secondary data was obtained from academic literature, madrasah policy documents, and previous research related to the countenance stake program evaluation model.

To ensure clarity of procedures, data collection techniques are outlined in the following table.

Table 1. Data Collection Techniques and Instruments

Technique	Instrument / Focus	Objective
In-depth interview	Semi-structured interview guide with madrasah principals, mas'ul tahfidz, and students.	Exploring views, experiences, and obstacles in implementing the tahfidz program.
Observation	Observation sheet of the tahfidz learning process and muroja'ah activities.	Obtain factual data regarding interactions, methods, and disciplines in the learning process.
Documentation	Policy documents, memorization notes, activity reports, and implementation photos.	Verify and complete information obtained from interviews and observations.

Data analysis followed procedures (Miles & Huberman, 1994) which included three stages: (1) data reduction by selecting and focusing information relevant to the research theme, (2) presenting data in the form of narrative descriptions that describe patterns and relationships between findings, and (3) drawing conclusions which were carried out repeatedly to ensure consistency of the meaning of the findings.

Data validity was tested through triangulation of sources and techniques, comparing the results of interviews, observations, and documentation. Furthermore, researchers considered aspects of credibility, transferability, and dependability, as outlined in the guidelines (Creswell & Creswell, 2018) , to ensure the validity of the research results.

Furthermore, data analysis was conducted following the evaluative logic of the Countenance Stake Model, systematically comparing the planned conditions (intents) with the conditions found in the field (observations) for each component of antecedent, transaction, and outcome. Data obtained from interviews, observations, and documentation were not only used as

corroboration, but were also cross-analyzed to identify congruences, differences, and contextual tensions between data sources. Through this process, researchers were able to uncover variations in program implementation, teacher pedagogical adaptations, and unplanned impacts in the implementation of the Superior Tahfidz Program.

Data Collection

Data collection in this evaluative study was conducted in stages, utilizing various sources relevant to the evaluation focus of the Outstanding Tahfidz Program at MI Muhammadiyah Tahfidzul Qur'an Matesih. The entire data collection process was designed to align with the Countenance Stake Model framework, which assesses *antecedent*, *transaction*, and *outcome aspects*.

In the initial stage, researchers collected several official documents related to the program's implementation. These documents included the Tahfidz curriculum, program implementation guidelines, activity schedules, standard operating procedures, and records of student memorization progress. Through these documents, researchers gained insight into the program's initial planning, its intended goals, and the institution's readiness to provide structural and administrative support.

In addition to documentation, direct observations were also conducted during the Tahfidz (Qur'an Recitation) learning process in the classroom. These observations helped researchers see how the program was implemented on a daily basis, including the memorization methods used by teachers, the rhythm of the muroja'ah (recitation) process, interactions between teachers and students, and the learning climate established in the classroom. These observational findings are crucial for evaluating the extent to which the learning process is proceeding as planned.

To broaden understanding, semi-structured interviews were conducted with various stakeholders, including madrasah principals, Tahfidz program coordinators, Tahfidz teachers, students, and parents. These interviews provided a broader perspective on implementation dynamics, challenges faced, perceptions of the program's success, and factors contributing to the effectiveness of Tahfidz learning.

Data on student learning outcomes—specifically memorization achievement, pronunciation quality, and consistency of muroja'ah—is also collected as part of the *outcome component evaluation*. This information is not presented numerically, but is understood as a qualitative indicator of the extent to which the program's objectives have been achieved.

All of these data collection techniques complement each other and provide a complete picture of the program's condition from the planning stage to the results achieved.

Data Analysis

The data analysis in this study follows the evaluation pattern developed by Stake through the Countenance Model. This model emphasizes the importance of comparing program expectations or plans (intents) with the reality of implementation on the ground (observations). Therefore, the analysis was conducted by organizing and interpreting data based on three main components: *antecedent*, *transaction*, and *outcome*.

First, an antecedent analysis was conducted to assess the program's readiness, particularly regarding objectives, planning, and resource availability. Data from documents, interviews with school officials, and internal policy notes were used to assess whether the program's foundation was robust and realistic. This analysis helped compare the program's intended standards with the actual conditions encountered.

Next, transaction analysis focused on the program implementation process. Observation and interview findings were analyzed to determine how the program ran on a daily basis, including how Tahfidz teachers managed learning, the extent to which the memorization approach was implemented effectively, and how well the learning process aligned with the designed curriculum. This analysis aimed to identify gaps or alignments between practice and the referenced learning SOPs.

In the outcome stage, analysis is conducted by examining students' memorization achievements and changes in religious behavior related to program implementation. Outcome data is not presented numerically, but rather analyzed from the perspective of the meaningfulness of the results—as a manifestation of whether the objectives of the Tahfidz program have been substantially achieved. This analysis examines how student achievement compares to program targets and how these results are perceived by teachers and the school.

The entire analysis process was conducted using a thematic approach, grouping data into evaluative themes such as institutional readiness, effectiveness of teaching methods, parental support, consistency of muroja'ah (religious study), and other inhibiting and supporting factors. To ensure the validity of the findings, triangulation was conducted through comparisons between data sources and between data collection techniques. Thus, the analysis results provide an objective, comprehensive, and academically accountable evaluative picture.

To strengthen the credibility of the findings, triangulation was conducted analytically, not merely procedurally. Interview data was directly compared with classroom observation findings and madrasah policy documents to assess consistency between reported experiences, institutional planning, and ongoing learning practices. Discrepancies in findings across data sources were treated as an essential part of the evaluative analysis, particularly to identify limitations, implementation challenges, and variations in program outcomes.

Results and Discussion

Program Overview as an Evaluative Context (Local and Empirical Framing)

The Quran memorization program at MI Muhammadiyah Tahfidzul Qur'an Matesih is positioned as a flagship program integrated into the madrasah's daily learning structure. However, in an evaluative context, this program is understood not merely as a normative religious activity but as a pedagogical system that relies on institutional readiness, quality of implementation, and the capacity to adapt to student characteristics.

Empirically, this program is implemented through a daily schedule of memorization and muroja'ah (recitation), with memorization targets set in stages according to grade level. This practice establishes a distinctive institutional rhythm, where memorization activities are not additional but become a core structure of school life. Field observations indicate that this routine significantly shapes student behavior patterns, such as regularity of time, adherence to schedules, and internalization of discipline based on religious rituals.

However, field findings also indicate that the translation of spiritual and character values does not occur automatically or uniformly. The effectiveness of character formation is greatly influenced by teacher consistency, parental support, and students' ability to manage the burden of memorization. Thus, this overview of the program not only demonstrates its conceptual strength but also opens up space for critical analysis of the factors that enable and limit its effectiveness.

Analysis Based on the Countenance Stake Model

Antecedents: Institutional Readiness and Contextual Constraints

Within the antecedent dimension, the analysis is developed on the situational requirements that inform the execution of the Superior Tahfidz Program prior to the learning process in the day-to-day practice. As per the Countenance Stake model, this section reviews how the planned program design aligns with the conditions present in the field and primarily the institution, curriculum support, teacher preparedness, and contextual variables on memorization routines by students. The results show that the madrasah is based on clear planning by use of structured targets, planned Tahfidz sessions and coordination of the institutions in support of sustaining the program. This validates the fact that the program has been framed as a core education orientation program in the madrasah and not a secondary activity.

Such an institutional orientation is greatly manifested in leadership testimony. The principal insisted that the program was made as part of the overall direction of the madrasah and not just a token religious program. As the principal explained,

“The Tahfidz program is not an additional activity in this madrasah. It is part of our main educational direction, so we have prepared targets, schedules, and internal coordination to support it.”

In another interview segment, the same institutional commitment was reaffirmed through managerial language that stressed consistency and continuity. The principal stated,

“We do not want this program to depend only on individual enthusiasm. It must be organized and sustained as part of the school system.”

These assertions reinforce the documentation findings and indicate that institutional readiness can be observed not just in the written planning but also seen in administrative commitment and long term program orientation.

Despite that, the evidence provided by interview indicates that institutional preparedness is not necessarily matched to equal preparedness on the instructional level. The masul tahfidz did not deny that the program structure and guidance are already there but practices in classrooms is still different based on the pedagogical approach and experience of the teacher in question. As one coordinator noted,

“In terms of program structure, we already have a clear guide, but in classroom practice each teacher still has a different way of handling students. Some are very adaptive, while others still focus mainly on target completion.”

This point was reinforced in another statement that highlighted the need for greater alignment among teachers. The coordinator explained,

“The program is clear on paper, but in practice we still need to strengthen how teachers respond to students who progress at different speeds.”

These observations fail to undermine the result of institutional support. They perfect them instead by demonstrating that organizational readiness and pedagogical readiness are built in an uneven way and demand continuous capacity building.

Interviews with teachers will help to get a clearer idea of how this problem manifests itself under the real classroom conditions. One of the Tahfidz teachers explained that it is hard to cope with the heterogeneous learning profiles of students and it is hard to use a unified pace in memorizing activities. The teacher stated,

“The challenge is not only teaching memorization, but teaching children with very different speeds. Some can repeat and retain quickly, while others need more time and more repetition.”

In another account, a teacher emphasized the emotional dimension of this variation by noting,

“If we push all children with the same target on the same day, some become discouraged. They are not unwilling, but they need a different rhythm.”

These are significant statements in that they demonstrate how antecedent conditions are formed by those structures not only of formal planning but also that realisticness of the pedagogical assumptions within the program structure. The present issue with a solid program design is that it might be challenged by the lack of differentiated teaching preparedness when the learner diversity is not met completely.

The analysis of antecedents also shows that time allocation and workload balance are the key contextual factors that are going to impact the quality of the future implementation. It has been observed and interviewed that the Tahfidz program has got a serious institutional space in the school routine, which is a major strength of the program. Meanwhile, educators have complained that certain learners feel tired when the intensive memorization tasks are overlapped with the normal schoolwork. One of the classroom teachers described,

“The Tahfidz schedule is intensive and very valuable, but for some students it can become tiring when they also have to keep up with regular subjects on the same day.”

This concern was echoed by another teacher who remarked,

“Sometimes the issue is not motivation. The children want to learn, but their energy decreases when the day is too full.”

These testimonies do not go against the institutional commitment to Tahfidz. Instead, they demonstrate that high support on scheduling is yet to be carefully balanced pedagogically to ensure that the program is effective and sustainable to students.

The other significant antecedent variables appear through the interview data of family support and home based murojaah practices. It was frequently observed by teachers that students who receive regular help at home are better prepared to come to class, have better retention and have more confidence in the setoran. One teacher of Tahfidz has said,

“Children whose parents help them review at home usually come to class more prepared. They are calmer during setoran and more confident when repeating.”

A similar observation was expressed by another teacher who stated,

“When murojaah continues at home, we can use class time more effectively because the child is not starting again from the beginning.”

These accounts show that antecedent readiness extends beyond the institutional environment and is closely connected to the continuity of support in the home setting.

Parental interviews further deepen this contextual reading and help explain why students may respond differently within the same program structure. One parent stated,

“When we can accompany murojaah at home, the child is more consistent. But if the family is busy, the progress is usually slower and the child forgets more easily.”

Another parent described the challenge in practical terms and noted,

“We support the program, but sometimes work schedules make it difficult to accompany the child every day. On those days the child usually needs more repetition at school.”

These quotes are particularly useful since it demonstrates that the variations in student preparedness cannot be merely individual characteristics. They are influenced by time in the

family and the environment at home as well as a memorization ecosystem in the child. By this, the antecedent dimension will involve institutional planning, classroom readiness, and household conditions that have some combination to influence the beginning of implementation.

The antecedent findings are relevant to the original contents of the article but provide a more ground base explanation of the functioning of institutional readiness in real contextual conditions. The program demonstrates a definite planning base, a powerful institutional back up and a curriculum model that facilitates the implementation of the Quranic culture in the madrasah. Simultaneously, the data of the interview and observation indicate practical limitations affecting the quality of the further implementation, in particular, the difference in the memorization rate of students, the challenge of the equilibrium between studying time, the lack of homogeneity in pedagogical readiness of teachers, and inconsistency in home support of murojaah. These antecedent conditions are best viewed as active determinants of program implementation, but not as background description since it is these conditions that have a direct effect on the unfolding of learning interactions as well as the difference in outcomes with different students and classroom settings.

Transaction: Pedagogical Practices, Variability, and Implementation Fidelity

On the dimension of transaction, the assessment is focused on the way the Superior Tahfidz Program is applied to practice in the day-to-day learning and how the applied implementation is a reflection of the program design which was planned at the institutional level. In the logic of evaluation applied in this research, this section does not end in querying whether the activities were conducted. It also analyzes the real process of learning that went on in the classroom, how the teachers would arrange the memorization process, how they addressed various student needs and the way students engaged in the teaching process. Due to that fact, the findings of the transaction are perused through the interaction among manifested practice in the classroom, accounts of the interviews, and documentary traces of the program implementation, in such a way that the analysis is based on the sources of data which are outlined in the method section.

The results indicate that the process of implementation was mostly directed towards the desired course of the program and established a consistent teaching pace. Observations in the classroom reveal that tahfidz learning was done in the form of repetitive routines that involved submission of memorization, repetition, and reinforcement. The significance of this recurring structure is that the program was introduced as a structured and sustained procedure as opposed to a sporadic activity. Procedurally, the transaction stage shows a high degree of continuity of the procedure particularly in the continuation of the routine nature of the tahfidz sessions and the continued participation of the students in the memorization work over learning meetings.

This trend of consistency is also present in data of interview provided by the program managers and teachers who outlined the implementation as something that was comparatively in line with the formulated program design. One coordinator explained,

“The implementation has followed the program direction quite well because the schedule is clear and the teachers understand the daily flow of tahfidz activities.”

A teacher offered a related account and stated,

“In general the process runs according to plan because the children already know the routine of murojaah and setoran.”

These assertions reinforce the results of the observation and indicate that the implementation fidelity is at the stage of program structure has been already established. Simultaneously, the data also reveal that the regularity in routine does not necessarily lead to the regularity of the quality of pedagogy in classrooms.

Upon further examination of the data of the transaction, it can be seen that change in pedagogical practice is also a significant aspect of implementation. This difference does not lie in a peripheral fact, but in a key appraisal issue since the quality of tahfidz program depends not only on the presence of routines but also on how these routines are taught in a pedagogical way. In certain observed lessons the teachers did vary the pacing, repeat passages using smaller units, and encouraged the students in ways that allowed them to be relaxed and attentive when submitting the memorization. In other sessions, instruction was less oriented to continuing target progression, which could occasionally eliminate the opportunity to do differentiated instructions with the students who require a more repetitive or encouraging function before reciting.

The interviews with teachers can be used to understand the reason behind this variation and its impact on the instruction process. One Tahfidz teacher stated,

“Sometimes I divide the verses into smaller parts so the children do not feel overwhelmed, especially those who need more repetition.”

Another teacher described the competing demands that shape classroom decisions and explained,

“We try to keep the target moving, but when many students are still struggling we have to choose between repeating longer or continuing the next part.”

These descriptions indicate that classroom implementation is not a matter to just follow a specific order. It entails constant evaluation and bargaining according to school preparedness, time and pressure to achieve program goals. In this respect, the transaction dimension demonstrates the complexity of living implementation and not a technical process of implementation.

The aspect of student experience is of particular significance in interpreting the quality of interaction with the pedagogue at this stage. Since students will be among the participants in the interviews in this study, their testimonies will provide first-hand information on the reception of teaching practices in the classroom. One of the students mentioned a supportive learning experience and indicated,

“When the ustadz or ustazah asks us to repeat slowly first, it is easier to remember and I feel more confident when reciting.”

Another student described a more difficult experience and noted,

“If I have not memorized well and many friends are already ahead, I feel nervous when my turn comes.”

These remarks shed light on a significant aspect in the analysis of the transactions. The implementation is not merely effective due to the presence of the methods, i.e. murojaah and setoran, but due to the emotional climate of the classroom established by the response given by the teacher, the way he/she paces, and the extent of comparison made by his/her peers.

It is also demonstrated in the findings that the implementation is stronger when teachers can integrate structured routines with interactive and responsive teaching practices. This corresponds with the pattern of the program that has been outlined in the article and as noted,

the application of talaqqi, murajaah and peer learning are some of the techniques that are used during the implementation process. What comes out of the transaction data is that fidelity is most significant when it gets interpreted as fidelity to educational purpose as opposed to strict uniformity of technique. That is, it seems that what helps make the program viable is not just the repetition of the procedure, but the ability of teachers to maintain the discipline and purpose of the program and simply to adjust the guidance to the real classroom situation. This meaning is also shown in the statement of the coordinator that

“What must remain consistent is the goal and the routine, but the way teachers guide the children sometimes needs adjustment according to the class condition.”

Even within this generally stable implementation pattern, the transaction findings still reveal practical constraints that influence the depth and pace of classroom interaction. Teachers repeatedly identified limited instructional time and differences in student memorization ability as the main challenges in maintaining both quality correction and equitable attention. One teacher explained,

“The main difficulty is time. We want every child to get proper correction, but class time is limited and the memorization levels are very different.”

Another teacher added,

“Some students need repeated attention in the same part, so if we are not careful other students wait too long and lose focus.”

Such assertions are noteworthy in that they reveal how restrictive characteristics established in other parts of the article manifest in the real educational experience. Here it is not a matter of accomplishing activities but rather maintaining the quality of pedagogical engagement in circumstances of limited time and diversified learner preparedness.

This reading is further supported in documentation data, which helps verify continuity of tahfidz routines over the course of learning sessions and give a record of program activity that can be verified with observation and interview results. When we look at these sources of data as a whole, the implementation phase does not seem to be problematic or idealized in any simplistic way. It is presented as an operating instructional process that has a definite routine form and demonstrates evident commitment, as well as presents diversity in pedagogical performance and responsiveness in classrooms. It renders the dimension of transaction analytically useful as it can be used to expose the process whereby the program design is put into action based on teacher judgment, classroom dynamics and the day to day realities of memorizing work with students.

The findings of the transaction are thus wholly consistent with the original content of the article and provide more grounded and articulate description of pedagogical practices, variability, and fidelity to implementation. The implementation phase is conceptualizable as a more or less stable goal oriented process that is facilitated by institutional routines and sustained teacher effort. Simultaneously, its quality is subject to the constant pedagogical adaptation to the heterogeneity of students, the shortness of learning time and the lack of teacher preparedness. With such a view, the transaction aspect of it makes sense because it is not routine alone that drives the program forward. It is projected through the continuous efforts of creating that routine educationally significant to various learners under realistic classroom situations.

Outcome: Differentiated Impacts and Unintended Consequences

Under the outcome dimension, the evaluation does not assess the program results as a unitary end point but rather a spectrum of student experiences and outcomes that arise out of varying

conditions of learning. This orientation entirely aligns with the evaluative logic of the study in that the outcome component is understood qualitatively based on meaningfulness of results in terms of their reliance to program objectives, teacher perceptions and school observations and not solely on the basis of numerical scoring. To this end, the result findings in this section can be interpreted as a construal narrative of development, personality development, and student welfare as they manifest through documentation, interview data, and field observations.

The records of the memorization success indicate that the vast majority of students demonstrated a slow but steady advance in the memorization development, although the speed and regularity of that advance differed. This observation is consistent with the original outcome of the article that the outcome dimension is to be interpreted as a range of various accomplishments and not as a unified performance of all children. The only thing that comes out in the data is not the lack of progress, but the differentiated nature of progress. Other students demonstrate more consistent progress over time whereas others exhibit changing performance that is highly correlated with patterns of support, motivation as well as persistence of practice outside school hours.

This discernible trend is also largely echoed in the interview responses of teachers and program coordinators. One of the teachers of Tahfidz told me,

“Some children progress steadily because they repeat at home and come prepared, while others can memorize in class but lose fluency when murojaah is not continued.”

A coordinator described a similar pattern and noted,

“The program gives results, but the results are not equal for every child because the learning support around them is also different.”

These words enrich the reading of the documentary because they demonstrate that the difference in results is not an individual issue. It is influenced by how school based instruction interacts with the bigger support ecosystem that schools surround each student with.

The role of home support seems to be among the most pronounced explanatory factors in the outcome findings. The article has already reported that memorization achievement is more stable in student with better home support and higher intrinsic motivation.

This pattern becomes more tangible in terms of interview data. One teacher stated,

“Children who continue murojaah at home usually maintain their memorization better and need less repetition when they come back to class.”

A parent expressed this in everyday terms and said,

“If we can accompany the child regularly, the memorization is more stable, but when we are busy the child often needs to rebuild the same part again.”

These records indicate that the outcome dimension can not be narrowed down to school performance only since memorization continuity requires adherence to the rhythms of support both at school and at home.

As well as the improvements in memorization, the result data also imply significant shifts in the character and learning habits of the students. It has been observed and reported by interviews that some good things are happening, including increased discipline, adherence to school rules, and the development of more independent murojaah practices; this is entirely true to what the article initially said about the results of character. According to a teacher this change was characterized as follows,

“Some students who were previously less disciplined have become more orderly because the tahfidz routine trains them to come prepared and be responsible for their recitation.”

Another teacher highlighted the habit forming aspect and noted,

“We can see progress not only from memorization but also from attitude because some children begin to repeat on their own without being told.”

These results matter as they demonstrate that the success of the program is not limited to successful memorization of technical materials, but also moral and behavioral aspects that are at the core of the educational aim of the program.

Meanwhile, the assessment also helps validate the idea that not all students experience these positive outcomes equally. It has already been mentioned in the article that certain students are resistant to the pressure to memorize and require more individual coaching. This trend can be observed in the interviews with teachers and students who tell about losing track, feeling under pressure, and unease during the memorization tasks. One teacher explained,

“There are students who improve in memorization but become tense when the target feels too heavy, so they need a different approach and more encouragement.”

A student expressed this more personally and said,

“I want to memorize well, but sometimes I feel afraid when I am not ready and my friends are already ahead.”

These testimonies indicate that the differences in outcomes cannot be understood as either success and failure. They represent different reactions of students to the same system of instruction and point to more differentiated support that should be provided.

One aspect that needs to be mentioned in this study is that the outcome evaluation has identified some unintended consequences that come along with the positive gains of the program. Similar to the original findings provided in the article, the data collected during the interviews and observations reveals that certain students report feeling mild mental fatigue and anxiety due to the memorization tasks to be performed, particularly those where the targets are experienced as challenging or where repetition is perceived as a pressure but not reinforcement. One Tahfidz teacher noted,

“Sometimes the children are not refusing the program, they are just tired, and if we do not read that condition carefully their motivation can drop.”

Another teacher added,

“There are moments when students become anxious before setoran because they worry about forgetting, even though they have tried.”

The importance of these testimonies is that they demonstrate aspects of student experience that otherwise would live only inside the program based on the gains of memorization.

This does not imply that the program is not effective. Rather, it explains in what conditions the effectiveness is to be understood. According to the findings of the outcome, the success of the Superior Tahfidz Program can better be measured by a compromise between the performance in memorizing and characterizing and the longevity of the learning well being of the students, which is also the central implication which is made in the original article. An evaluator point of view was captured in a practical manner by a coordinator who said,

“The target is important, but the children must also remain comfortable and motivated so the memorization can continue in the long term.”

This assertion indicates a sophisticated interpretation of outcome evaluation since it places success in the context of the larger pedagogical role of keeping students psychologically prepared and sustained in learning.

The resultant findings are thus completely consistent with the initial contents of the article and offer a more substantiated description of various effects and unintended implications. The program portrays a positive impact to memorization development and formation of religious characters among students, but these benefits are unevenly distributed among students because of dissimilarity in their motivational levels, home support and learning preparation. Simultaneously, the fact that mild fatigue and anxiety appear among some students demonstrates that outcome assessment should be sensitive to the well being of students as an educational effectiveness issue instead of a different one. By doing so, the outcome dimension fills in the evaluative picture by demonstrating that program success is actual and significant, yet contextual, relational, and based on the persistence of supportive guidance in the school and home settings.

The evaluation results indicate that the Countenance Stake Model is able to uncover the complex relationship between the planning, implementation, and outcomes of the Tahfidz program at MI Muhammadiyah Tahfidzul Qur'an Matesih. However, the empirical findings also confirm that the alignment between these dimensions is dynamic and not always linear.

Theoretically, these findings reinforce Stake's (1967) view that program evaluation must capture the tension between intent and the reality of implementation. The Tahfidz program at this madrasah demonstrated strengths in terms of vision and institutional commitment, but faced challenges in pedagogical adaptation and differentiation of learning outcomes.

Compared to previous research, this study not only confirms the general effectiveness of tahfidz programs but also highlights the variability in implementation and outcomes rarely discussed in the literature. Thus, the study's primary contribution lies in understanding that the success of tahfidz programs is not uniform, but rather depends on the readiness of the context, the quality of pedagogical interactions, and the support of the learning ecosystem.

Conclusion

Based on the results of the analysis using the Countenance Stake model, the evaluation of the Superior Tahfidz Program at MI Muhammadiyah Tahfidzul Qur'an Matesih shows that this program has a good management structure and direction, with integration between the planning aspects (antecedent), implementation (transaction), and results or impacts (outcome).

In the antecedent stage, the Tahfidz program at MI Muhammadiyah Tahfidzul Qur'an Matesih was designed with clear planning and oriented towards the goal of forming a Qur'anic generation. The institution's vision and mission, Tahfidz curriculum, and student development system demonstrate strong institutional readiness. This finding aligns with research by Arba et al. (2024) and Alafthoni (2024) which emphasized that thorough planning is a key factor in determining the effectiveness of the Tahfidzul Qur'an program.

During the transaction phase, Tahfidz activities utilize varied and interactive methods such as talaqqi, muraja'ah, and peer learning, thereby increasing student engagement in the learning process. These results confirm the findings of Marwah et al. (2023) and Azizah & Lisnawati (2022) that the success of the Tahfidz program is strongly influenced by a fun learning approach and a harmonious teacher-student relationship.

In the outcome stage, this program demonstrated a positive impact on improving memorization skills, discipline, and developing students' religious character. These results align with research by Ziyad Alafthoni (2024) and Marwah et al. (2023), which confirmed that internalizing Quranic values through memorization activities can strengthen students' spiritual and moral dimensions.

Overall, the application of the Countenance Stake model in the evaluation of this program shows that the relationship between context, process, and results has been running consistently. The Superior Tahfidz Program at MI Muhammadiyah Tahfidzul Qur'an Matesih can be said to be effective in forming students with Qur'anic character and academic competitiveness, although efforts are still needed to strengthen the field of evaluation management and development of teaching staff to ensure the sustainability of the program's quality.

The findings of this study indicate that the effectiveness of the Superior Tahfidz Program is not uniform, but rather influenced by the readiness of student input, teacher pedagogical competence, and readiness for classroom learning implementation. By using the Countenance Stake Model, this study not only assesses the achievement of program outcomes but also reveals the perceptions and adjustments that occur between institutional planning and learning practices in the field. Therefore, the program's success needs to be understood contextually and dynamically, not solely based on the achievement of memorization targets. Practically, the results of this study emphasize the importance of strengthening learning and teacher mentoring in the implementation of the tahfidz program, and contribute to understanding the application of the Countenance Stake evaluation model in the context of Islamic education.

Acknowledgment

We would like to express our gratitude for the cooperation of our colleagues who participated in this research. We also extend our gratitude to the principal and the tahfidz instructor, teachers, and all students of MI Muhammadiyah Tahfidzul Qur'an Matesih who have permitted and assisted us in conducting this research, enabling us to complete this research with the data we obtained and further validate our research.

References

- Abdullah, N. M. S. A. N., Ab Rahim, F. N. B., & Isa, R. A. A. B. M. (2021). Exploring the challenges of sustaining Qur'anic memorization: A case study. *Journal of Islamic Educational Research*, 6(1), 1-17. <https://doi.org/10.22452/jier.vol6no2021.1>
- Abdullah, N. M. S. A. N., Sabbri, F. S. M., & Isa, R. A. A. M. (2019). Challenges and difficulties in memorizing the Qur'an in the Tahfiz classes among secondary learners. *AL-BURHĀN: Journal of Qur'ān and Sunnah Studies*, 3(2), 1-14. <https://doi.org/10.31436/alburhn.v3i2.138>
- Al Arifi, N., Zurqoni, Z., & Robingatin, R. (2026). Challenges in Qur'anic Memorization Learning at Elementary Schools: Systematic Literature Review. *Tafkir: Interdisciplinary Journal of Islamic Education*, 7(1), 188-202. <https://doi.org/10.31538/tijie.v7i1.2481>
- Amirudin, N., Anwar, K., Ifadah, A. S., Sya'bani, M. A. Y., & Basri, H. (2025). Analysis of Learning Evaluation Issues Affecting Educational Goal Achievement in Islamic Education. *International Research Journal of Multidisciplinary Scope*, 6(4), 299-312.

- Aziz, M. B., & Amir, A. N. (2025). Evaluating Value-Based Vocational Education Using Logic Model: A Qualitative Inquiry in Islamic Higher Education. *Tafkir: Interdisciplinary Journal of Islamic Education*, 6(3), 700-715. <https://doi.org/10.31538/tijie.v6i3.1969>
- Azizah, Y., & Lisnawati, S. (2022). Evaluation of the Al-Qur'an Memorization Program Using the Countenance Stake Model at SMPIT Darul Barokah, Depok City. *Journal of Education and Counseling*, 4 (6), 4210–4215.
- Creswell, J. W., & Creswell, J. D. (2018). *Research Design Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Methods Approaches*. In SAGE Publications, Inc. (Fifth edit). United States of America. <https://doi.org/10.2307/j.ctt2204s7w.11>
- Fatmawati, F., & Amaliah, R. (2025). The Love of the Qur'an Culture Program in Forming the Islamic Character of Elementary School Students. *ETDC: Indonesian Journal of Research and Educational Review*, 5(1), 774-784. <https://doi.org/10.51574/ijrer.v5i1.4593>
- Ferdinan, M. N., & Pewangi, M. (2025). Integration of Islamic values in the field of general studies at SMP Unismuh Makassar: evaluation of the stake countenance model approach. *Educational Process: International Journal*, 14, 1-22.
- Inu Aulia Arba, Iffat Bening Qhuru'in Ahmad, Ahmad Musyarofi, Siti Zahrotus Sania, Muhammad Fata Rayyan Ghafur, & Hesti Kusumaningrum. (2024). Evaluation of the Al-Qur'an Memorization Program Using the Countenance Stake Model at SDIT Al Iman. *Learning Dynamics: Journal of Education and Language*, 2 (1), 142–151. <https://doi.org/10.62383/dilan.v2i1.1129>
- Kip, H., Beerlage-de Jong, N., van Gemert-Pijnen, L. J., & Kelders, S. M. (2025). The CeHRes roadmap 2.0: update of a holistic framework for development, implementation, and evaluation of eHealth technologies. *Journal of Medical Internet Research*, 27, e59601. <https://doi.org/10.2196/59601>
- Marwah, RS, Hamid, A., Tamwif, I., Afidah R, A., & Amelia A, AN (2023). Implementation of the Tahfidz al-Qur'an Program to Improve the Spirituality of Students at MAN 2 Malang City. *Quality*, 11 (1), 111. <https://doi.org/10.21043/quality.v11i1.18434>
- Miles, M. B., & Huberman, A. M. (1994). *An Expanded Sourcebook Qualitative Data Analysis*. In R. Holland (Ed.), SAGE Publications, Inc. (2 ed., Vol. 1304). <https://doi.org/0803955405>
- Munif, M. (2025). Strategy-Based Learning Planning To Improve The Quality Of Al-Qur'an Memorization: A Study At Two Tahfiz Islamic Boarding Schools. *Journal of Studies in Academic, Humanities, Research, and Innovation*, 2(2), 119-131. <https://doi.org/10.71305/sahri.v2i2.254>
- Nahdia, N., Zubaidillah, MH, & Azmi, MNS (2023). Student Character Building through Religious Extracurricular Programs in Elementary Schools. *Basicedu Journal*, 7 (1), 593–602. <https://doi.org/10.31004/basicedu.v7i1.4632>
- Noor, A. S., Hermina, D., & Mof, Y. (2025). CIPP, Stake Model, Goal Free Model, Formative-Sumative Model (Applications in Education). *Journal Of Digital Learning And Distance Education*, 4(3), 1585-1592. <https://doi.org/10.56778/jdlde.v4i3.539>
- Pratiwi, F., Cahyana, U., & Ahmad, M. (2025). Transforming Quranic Excellence: Evaluating the Governance of Tahfizh Al-Qur'an Programs in Higher Education Based on the

CIPP Model. *Journal of Information Systems Engineering and Management* , 10 , 822–835.

- Purwati, E., & Arifin, Z. (2023). Evaluative study of the kurikulum merdeka learning system in Bandung Private Elementary Schools. *Curricula: Journal of Curriculum Development*, 2(2), 167-182. <https://doi.org/10.17509/curricula.v2i2.58991>
- Rabbani, M. F., Shohib, M. W., & Inayati, N. L. (2025). Overcoming Challenges in Qur'an Memorization: The Role of Motivation and Teaching Strategies Practices at Islamic Boarding School. *Journal of Islamic Education*, 10(1), 155-173.
- Rachmaningtyas, N. A. (2025). Portrait of the Implementation of Statistics Lectures in Islamic Religious Education: An Evaluative Study with the Countenance Stake Model. *Edusoshum: Journal of Islamic Education and Social Humanities*, 5(2), 285-295. <https://doi.org/10.52366/edusoshum.v5i2.156>
- Rahma, W. (2025). The Role of Qur'an-Hadith Teachers in Overcoming Memorization Difficulties among Grade IX Students at MTs Negeri Kota Sorong. *Indonesian Journal of Islamic Educational Review*, 2(3), 255-262. <https://doi.org/10.58230/ijier.v2i3.423>
- Rahmad, & Syamsul Hadi. (2024). Factors Influencing Quran Memorization Targets in Tahfidz Programs at Islamic Universities. *Didaktika: Journal of Education* , 13 (1), 1115–1132. <https://doi.org/10.58230/27454312.483>
- Rahmawati, I., Anwar, H., Wathoni, K., & Maromi, I. (2023). Building Public Trust through The Excellency Program; A Study on Tahfidz Branding in Islamic Boarding Schools. *Al-Tanzim: Journal of Islamic Education Management* , 7 (1), 287–298. <https://doi.org/10.33650/al-tanzim.v7i1.3897>
- Ramadani, M. S., & Rohman, F. (2025). Teachers' Pedagogical Competence and Students' Qur'anic Memorization Achievement: Evidence from an Islamic Tahfidz Senior High School. *Jurnal Islam Nusantara*, 9(4), 593-611.
- Ramadani, M. S., & Rohman, F. (2025). Teachers' Pedagogical Competence and Students' Qur'anic Memorization Achievement: Evidence from an Islamic Tahfidz Senior High School. *Jurnal Islam Nusantara*, 9(4), 593-611.
- Ribath, M. K., & Astutik, A. P. (2025). The Implementation of the Qur'an Tahfidz Programme at SD Muhammadiyah MBS Prambanan, Sleman: A Case Study on Its Impact on Academic Character and Islamic Identity Development. *Pendas: Jurnal Ilmiah Pendidikan Dasar*, 10(02), 296-305. <https://doi.org/10.23969/jp.v10i02.24581>
- Sarıgöz, O. K. A. N., & Kudret, E. (2025). An Examination of the 7th Grade Middle School Mathematics Curriculum Within the Scope of Stake's Program Evaluation Model. *International Journal of Education Technology and Scientific Researches*, (31). <http://doi.org/10.35826/ijetsar.787>
- Setiawan, H., Kausar, S., Hakim, M. N., & Husna, F. A. (2025). Integrating Tahfidz Program Management for Comprehensive Student Character Development. *Kharisma: Jurnal Administrasi Dan Manajemen Pendidikan*, 4(1), 44-59. <https://doi.org/10.59373/kharisma.v4i1.63>
- Stake, R. E. (1967). The countenance of educational evaluation. *Teachers College Record: The Voice of Scholarship in Education* , 68 (7), 1–15. <https://doi.org/10.1177/016146816706800707>

- Sugandi, S., Kulkarni, S., Mulyana, A., Haedari, A., & Casta, C. (2025). From Selection to Success: Assessing the Impact of Student Admissions Strategies on the Quality of Education. *Al-Tanzim: Journal of Islamic Education Management* , 9 (1), 86–98. <https://doi.org/10.33650/al-tanzim.v9i1.9096>
- Tajik, O., Golzar, J., & Noor, S. (2025). Purposive Sampling. *The SAGE Encyclopedia of Qualitative Research Methods* , 2 (May), 1–9. <https://doi.org/10.22034/ijels.2025.490681.1029>
- Telaumbanua, E., Harefa, P., Purnama, Y., Lubis, M. A., & Azizan, N. (2023). EVALUATION OF RESEARCH GRANT PROGRAMS INSTITUTE FOR RESEARCH AND COMMUNITY SERVICE STAKEMODEL. *JOURNAL OF COMMUNITY DEDICATION*, 2(3), 256-272.
- Thontawi, M., MY, M., Chaniago, F., Fiqhi, A., Hazairin, IN, & Afifah, Y. (2022). Tahfidz Al-Qur'an: A Study of Learning Management Systems in Higher Education. *AL-TANZIM: Journal of Islamic Education Management* , 6 (1), 574–585. <https://doi.org/10.33650/al-tanzim.v6i2.3535>
- Wiedemann, M., Schütte, M., Loer, K., Gerdes, A., & Thate, S. (2024). Evaluation of the incident management system of a bigger city during the winter flood 2023/24 in northern Germany: Organized (ir) responsibility in the pre-disaster phase. *International Journal of Disaster Risk Reduction*, 113, 104821. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijdrr.2024.104821>
- Yusuf, Y., Darodjat, D., Zakiyah, Z., & Hasan, I. (2025). Implementation of Tahfidzul Qur'an: Analysis of Implementation, Challenges, and Impacts on Student Learning and Development. *Eduvest-Journal of Universal Studies*, 5(6), 7106-7110. <https://doi.org/10.59188/eduvest.v5i6.51490>
- Zainuddin, Z. (2024, January). THE QUR'AN MEMORIZATION (TAHFIDZ) PROGRAM AS A FLAGSHIP INITIATIVE IN ENHANCING STUDENT. In *Proceeding of International Conference on Education, Society and Humanity* (Vol. 2, No. 1, pp. 1357-1364).
- Zhang, G., Zeller, N., Griffith, R., Metcalf, D., Williams, J., Shea, C., & Misulis, K. (2011). Using the context, input, process, and product evaluation model (CIPP) as a comprehensive framework to guide the planning, implementation, and assessment of service-learning programs. *Journal of Higher Education Outreach and Engagement*, 15(4), 57-84.
- Ziyyad Alafthoni, F. (2024). Evaluation of Islamic Religious Education and Character Learning Using the Countenance Stake Model. *Edukasi Islami: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam* , 13 (01), 59–72. <https://doi.org/10.30868/ei.v13i01.6115>