



Implementation of M-Passport Application in Improving the Quality of Public Services

Fadliastuti Rafi¹, Mulyadi Hamid¹, Muhammad Ridwan Arif²

¹Program Studi Magister Manajemen, Universitas Fajar Makassar, Indonesia

²Politeknik Negeri Ujung Pandang, Indonesia

*Corresponding Author: Fadliastuti Rafi



Article Info

Article history:

Received 17 January 2025

Received in revised form 20

April 2025

Accepted 15 July 2025

Keywords:

M-Passport Application in
Improving Service Quality

JEL Classification:

K11, K12, K24, O34, D18

Abstract

This study aims to (1) provide an overview of the implementation of the M-Passport application in the Passport service process, (2) assess its effectiveness and efficiency in improving service processes, and (3) identify obstacles faced during its implementation at the Makassar Class I TPI Immigration Office. The research adopts a mixed-method approach, involving 42 passport applicants and managers. Data were collected through interviews, questionnaires, and observations, and analyzed using data triangulation. The M-Passport application has significantly improved service procedures, offering clear, accessible guidelines for applicants. It ensures timely service completion and transparent payment details, enhancing overall user satisfaction. The application is supported by adequate infrastructure, including waiting areas, playrooms, breastfeeding rooms, separate toilets for public use and disabilities, and dedicated counters for Indonesian and foreign applicants. Information and service ambassadors are also available to assist users. The effectiveness of Passport services using the M-Passport application is rated at 84.56% ("Good"), while efficiency is rated at 83.88% ("Good"). Despite these achievements, challenges remain. Frequent maintenance and updates can render the application inaccessible for 2–3 days. Network issues also affect accessibility, while limited-service quotas occasionally prevent applicants from securing preferred schedules. The M-Passport application has improved the service experience at the Makassar Immigration Office but requires addressing maintenance, network reliability, and quota limitations to enhance its effectiveness and efficiency further.

Introduction

The Ministry of Law and Human Rights in this case the Directorate General of Immigration is a government organization (public sector) that also provides services to the community. One of the functions of immigration is to provide services in the field of immigration. One of the service products from immigration is a passport. The Directorate General of Immigration strives to provide optimal services in making passports. This is in accordance with the principle of public service Article 4 of Law Number 25 of 2009 on Public Services, namely that the Organizer is obliged to manage an Information System consisting of an Electronic or Non-Electronic Information System which at least includes, the organizer's profile, Law of the Republic of Indonesia Number 6 of 2011 concerning Immigration, vol. 11, 2011. Implementer profile, service standards, service information, complaint management and performance assessment (Wulandari et al., 2023; Kim & Lim, 2021; Rane et al., 2024; Val et al., 2021; Setiyani & Tjandra, 2022).

Immigration has the potential to cause social conflict, so the question of the natural security dilemma that needs to be asked is how the government will handle the problem (Beňuška &

Nečas 2021; Fawzi, 2022). More importantly, the question of whether the government responds to security problems (triggered by immigration) with preventive militarization is very important. If social harmony is maintained through high levels of heavy (preventive) militarization, this may have a negative impact on the provision of other public goods (such as education and infrastructure) in the economy. However, there is mixed evidence in the literature on the role of militarization in maintaining peace in highly divided societies. For example, it does not associate peace (in heterogeneous societies) with preventive militarization but rather associates some level of political stability (and harmony) with increased defense spending. Given this conflicting evidence, we examine whether immigrant-receiving countries have higher militarization to anticipate social friction (Gebremedhin & Mavisakalyan, 2023; Bloch & Silva, 2011).

Many countries have successfully implemented various technological applications to improve public service processes, especially in the field of immigration (Milakovich, 2021; Mwamure, 2013). The development of services developed by the government to improve public services is based on the use of information and communication technology in the form of online services, therefore information and communication technology plays a role in improving the quality and capacity of public services. The public service sector is encouraged by the government, and the development of information and communication technology has created a public service model (Watini et al., 2021; Anwary, 2023; Firman et al., 2023).

The quality of public services is an important aspect in the development of a country (Ngoc & Tien, 2023). The Indonesian government continues to strive to improve the quality of public services to meet the increasingly complex and diverse needs of the community (Engkus, 2023; Turner et al., 2022). One of the efforts is to utilize information and communication technology (ICT) to improve the effectiveness and efficiency of public services (Matlala & Maphoto, 2022; Tampi et al., 2022; Chatti, 2021). Efforts to improve the quality of public services, the use of information and communication technology (ICT) has become a major concern for many government agencies around the world.

One of the developments in information technology in public services at the Immigration office is the M-Passport application (Izzaturrahmah & Saputro, 2024; Lestari, 2024). The M-Passport application has been provided by the Directorate General of Immigration since January 18, 2022. One of the public services provided to the public is the passport processing service using the M-Passport application as an important travel document when traveling abroad (Fitri et al., 2023; Prameswari, 2022; Rabbani & Fajar, 2024).

The Class I TPI Makassar Immigration Office has 1 (one) Passport Service Unit (ULP) Gowa Regency. In addition, the Class I TPI Makassar Immigration Office also has 3 (three) Immigration Checkpoints (TPI), namely: 1). Sultan Hasanuddin International Airport, 2). Soekarno Hatta Seaport, 3). PT Semen Tonasa Special Terminal (Biringkassi Port).

Passport issuance is one of the important public services provided by the immigration authorities (Kipingu & Shayo, 2021). However, there are still several obstacles related to passport issuance services such as long queues and complicated procedures. Therefore, it is necessary to improve the quality and efficiency of passport issuance services by using technology such as the M-Passport application (PermenHAM, 2023; Cahyono, 2024). M-Passport was first introduced to the public on December 30, 2021 and was first tested at three Immigration Offices, namely the South Jakarta Class I Special Non-TPI Immigration Office, the Central Jakarta Class I Non-TPI Immigration Office, and the Class I Immigration Office Class I Special Non-TPI Central Jakarta, and the Tangerang Class I Special Non-TPI Immigration Office.

The acceleration of the implementation of passport service innovations through the M-Passport application continues to be improved by the Directorate General of Immigration, so that on February 18, 2022, a letter was issued by the Director of Immigration Traffic Number IMI.2-UM.01.01-4.0700 concerning Follow-up to the Implementation and Policy for the Implementation of Mobile Passports (M-Passports) at 107 Immigration Offices (Nurkumalawati & Salsha, 2023). The M-Passport application is to reduce people's mobility when taking care of passports and only need to upload required documents such as KTP, KK, birth certificates, diplomas, letters of recommendation from superiors, or other requirements in accordance with applicable provisions. Legal Regulations and Human Rights. Number 18 of 2022 concerning Amendments to the Regulation of the Minister of Law and Human Rights Number 8 of 2014 concerning Ordinary Passports and Travel Documents in Lieu of Passports. However, based on the results of the study, it was still seen that there were still people who did not fill in their personal data according to the requirements for making a passport.

Obstacles encountered in the M-Passport registration process include the large number of documents uploaded by the applicant that are not clearly legible, the uploaded documents are incorrect, the applicant does not bring the documents (Agustina, 2023; Azzam et al., 2023). As a service function, the Class I TPI Makassar Immigration Office measures the Realization and Performance Achievements every year, such as the performance achievements of the Class I TPI Makassar Immigration Office measuring employee performance through measuring the Public Satisfaction Index (IKM). Public Satisfaction Index. (IKM) Semester I 2023 and IKM Semester I 2022. The measurement of performance achievements each year is by comparing the results of the Public Satisfaction Index survey for semester I 2022 with semester I 2023. The IKM achievement for immigration services in the region for semester I 2022 was 3.98 or around 124% while for semester I 2023 it was 3.96 or around 122%. although the realization of IKM achieved in the first semester of 2022 and the first semester of 2023 exceeded the target that had been set. which is 3.20 but there was a decrease in IKM. from 2022 by 3.98 (124%) decreased in 2023 to 3.96 (122%). the data shows that the results of the Community Satisfaction Index (IKM) have decreased. The decrease in IKM results from 2022 to 2023 The data is important for improving IKM, by improving the quality of employee performance at the Class I TPI Makassar Immigration Office.

The M-Passport (Mobile Passport System) application was created as a solution to improve the service process at the Class I TPI Makassar Immigration Office As one of the important international entry points in Eastern Indonesia, the Class I TPI Makassar Immigration Office has a strategic role in regulating the flow of immigration. However, in reality there are still many challenges and obstacles such as long queues, slow administrative procedures and the difficulty of the public in accessing information. One of the systems in the M-Passport application is an online registration system to reduce queues and waiting times at the location for passport applicants.

Methods

Research Design

Mixed-method research design was used in this study in assessing the implementation of M-Passport application in the Class I Immigration Office TPI Makassar. Mixed-method design was selected to make a rather comprehensive and more detailed interpretation of the functioning of the application in practice. The quantitative aspect made it possible to measure the satisfaction of users, the effectiveness of the services as well as the efficiency of the operations and this could be done by using structured questionnaires. At the same time, the qualitative component reflected the situational facts, technical issues, and institutional practices

through the intensive interviews and face-to-face observations carried out in the field. The combination of the two methods would not only make this research statistically sound but also experience rich and that is the key to the evaluation of such an important innovation in a public service as M-Passport.

Research Site

The research in the Bus Station No.1 of Immigration Office Class I TPI Makassar was carried out at the Immigration office Class I TPI Makassar which is situated at Jalan Perintis Kemerdekaan Km.13. This office is one of the core units of public service located within the Directorate General of Immigration and is important in facilitation of the digital passport services which is realized via M-Passport application. The selection of this combination of the site was not accidental since the office has extensive services to the spectrum of services relating to issues in immigration and a lot of people to which the application of the office is used to addressing the needs of and hence provides a relevant and dynamic setting to witness and witness the strongest and weakest parts of the application on ground in real-time. Furthermore, the site is provided with a digital service infrastructure and special passport counters, which allows the study of the integration of the system into the working process and its relationship with customers and the service staff to get a tangible environment.

Subjects and Informaters

In this study, the research participants were selected to be 42 individuals who utilized the M-Passport application in fulfilling their passport request form in the office in Makassar. These people engaged in the quantitative component of the research process by answering the so-called pathway questionnaires aimed at measuring their experience of the application. Moreover, key informants were chosen in the qualitative part of it. These informants were immigration, system administrators, and service counter people involved directly in provision, or monitoring of M-Passport services. They were very instrumental in revealing the details of the operations, implementation process, recurrent problems which could hardly be revealed by survey means. This institutional and user combination enhanced this analysis and gave a better presence on the effectiveness and efficiency of the application.

Data Collection

This study was based on primary and secondary sources of data. The questionnaires, interviews, and field observations were used to collect the major data. All the 42 M-Passport users were assessed on the quality of its service using the structured questionnaires in two dimensions, namely, effectiveness and efficiency. The questionnaires included Likert-scale statements that gave an opportunity to measure the user satisfaction related to perceived performance on quantitative basis. On the qualitative data, semi structured interviews were carried out on immigration officers who were directly involved in the running of the M-Passport system. These interviews took a face-to-face form making it possible to clarify the meanings, make follow up questions and non-verbal message observation. Observation of some parts of the field gave further insight in that it enabled the researchers to view the service routines, the flow of customers and the status of infrastructure. The secondary data was retrieved based on internal performance documents and reports on the services, as well as on the Public Satisfaction Index (IKM) issued by the Makassar Immigration Office, which extended the institutional standards to the analysis and validated those trends observed in primary data.

Researcher's Role

Various crucial responsibilities were taken by the researcher during the process of conducting research. The researcher as the designer carried out this responsibility of defining a study conception, appraising the methods and formulating data gathering tools to suit the objectives of researched study. In the period of the data collection, the researcher was actively involved in the administration of questionnaires, conducting of the interviews, and field notes by carrying out an observation, so as to guarantee the accurateness and reliability of data. The researcher was adherent to the ethical principles throughout the study by getting an informed consent, keeping the participants anonymous, and ensuring their data confidentiality. The researcher was also a neutral interpreter since he analyzed all the deeper data without any biases and gave conclusions that were evidence-based. This multi role participation guaranteed the rational consistency of methodology and increased the credibility of the study results.

Data Analysis

The analysis procedure was systematic as it entailed a dual-path analysis process, in connection with the mixed-method design of the study. The descriptive statistics were used to process the quantitative data collected on the questionnaires. All the responses were transformed to percentage scores pertaining to the percent agreement with different statements referring to service effectiveness and efficiency. The results were separated as per the standard interpretive labels (i.e. that of either being a Good or Very Good), which enabled proper interpretation across all the participants. In the meantime, thematic analysis of qualitative information through interviews and observations was done. The interview transcripts were coded by the researcher with a view to determining patterns, repetitive points, and important observations concerning the aspect of service flow, application performance, and user experience. This thematic analysis enabled the study to compare certain operational problems, e.g., server crashing or quotas being reached, with more generalized critique of service quality. Triangulation, which included the comparison of the questionnaire responses, with the narration of the interviews and with the observational reports was the process of assimilating the two types of data. This method ensured that the final interpretations were both quantitatively validated and qualitatively enriched, thereby reinforcing the reliability and depth of the research conclusions.

Result and Discussion

Results of the Questionnaire on the Effectiveness and Efficiency of Passport Services Using the M-Passport Application

Effectiveness of Passport services using the M-Passport Application

To answer the implementation of the M-Passport application in increasing the effectiveness of the Passport service process at the Class I TPI Makassar Immigration Office based on the questionnaire results below.

Table 1. Effectiveness of Passport services with use M-Passport Application

No	Statement Items	Mark					Category
		STS	TS	BS	S	SS	
		1	2	3	4	5	
1	The implementation of the M-Passport application has an impact on better Passport	3	1	0	17	21	$177/210 \times 100 = 84\%$ (Good)

	services at the Class I TPI Makassar Immigration Office.						
2	The implementation of the M-Passport application for Passport services at the Class I TPI Makassar Immigration Office was smooth and did not experience any obstacles.	3	1	0	19	19	$176/210 \times 100 = 83.8$ (Good)
3	The implementation of the M-Passport application for Passport services at the Class I TPI Makassar Immigration Office is right on target.	1	3	1	18	19	$177/210 \times 100 = 84\%$ (Good)
4	The implementation of the M-Passport application for Passport services at the Class I TPI Makassar Immigration Office can achieve the target of better service goals.	1	3	1	18	19	$175/210 \times 100 = 83\%$ (Good)
5	The implementation of the M-Passport application for Passport services at the Class I TPI Makassar Immigration Office has been implemented and has regulations.	1	2	1	13	25	$185/210 \times 100 = 88\%$ (Good)
Amount		9	10	3	85	103	Average
Percent (%)		4.2%	4.8 %	1.4%	40.5%	49 %	84.56% Good.

Source: questionnaire data

Based on the results of the questionnaire given to 42 people who were taking care of Passports at the Class I TPI Makassar Immigration Office to get an overview of the "Effectiveness of Passport services with use of the M-Passport Application" the results of the questionnaire are as follows: The implementation of the M-Passport application has an impact on better Passport services at the Class I TPI Makassar Immigration Office 84% in the Good category The implementation of the M-Passport application for Passport services at the Class I TPI Makassar Immigration Office was smooth and did not experience any obstacles 83.8% Good Category. The implementation of the M-Passport application for Passport services at the Class I TPI Makassar Immigration Office is on target at 84% in the good category. The implementation of the M-Passport application for Passport services at the Class I TPI Makassar Immigration Office can achieve the target of better service of 83% in the Good Category. The implementation of the M-Passport application for Passport services at the Class I TPI Makassar Immigration Office has been implemented and has a regulation of 88% in the good category.

The average percentage of the 5 indicators of Passport service effectiveness using the M-Passport Application at the Class I TPI Makassar Immigration Office is 84.56% in the good category. From the results of the questionnaire on "Effectiveness of Passport services with the use of the M-Passport Application at the Class I TPI Makassar Immigration Office" although in the good category, it still needs improvement towards the Very Good category. (90 -100%) the indicator that almost entered the very good category was "The implementation of the M-Passport application for Passport services at the Class I TPI Makassar Immigration Office has

been implemented and has regulations" with a value of 88%. Also, that requires attention and improvement based on the results of the questionnaire even though the category is good such as 1). The implementation of the M-Passport application for Passport services at the Class I TPI Makassar Immigration Office is right on target, 2). The implementation of the M-Passport application for Passport services at the Class I TPI Makassar Immigration Office can achieve the target of better service goals and 3). The implementation of the M-Passport application for Passport services at the Class I TPI Makassar Immigration Office has been implemented and has regulations. Of the 3 statements, 9% of informants stated that they disagreed and strongly disagreed with the statement that the M-Passport application was right on target, and the goal of better service in the implementation of the M-Passport Application. at the Class I TPI Makassar Immigration Office.

Efficient Passport services with the use of the M-Passport Application

To answer the implementation of the M-Passport application in increasing the efficiency of the Passport service process at the Class I TPI Makassar Immigration Office based on the questionnaire results below.

Table 2. Efficient Passport services with the use of M-Passport Application

No	Statement Items	Mark					Category
		STS	TS	BS	S	SS	
		1	2	3	4	5	
1	The implementation of the M-Passport application for Passport services at the Class I TPI Makassar Immigration Office is optimal in achieving Passport service objectives.	1	3	1	17	20	$178/210 \times 100 = 84.7\%$
2	Implementation of the M-Passport application for Passport services at the Class I TPI Makassar Immigration Office. The procedure is easy to implement.	1	3	1	17	20	$178/210 \times 100 = 84.7\%$
3	The implementation of the M-Passport application for Passport services at the Class I TPI Makassar Immigration Office has a very high success rate.	1	3	3	16	19	$175/210 \times 100 = 83\%$
4	The implementation of the M-Passport application for Passport services at the Class I TPI Makassar Immigration Office takes a relatively short time (not long).	1	3	3	17	18	$174/210 \times 100 = 82.8\%$
5	The implementation of the M-Passport application for Passport services at the Class I TPI Makassar Immigration Office, the costs incurred have not increased from the previous costs.	1	3	2	16	20	$177/210 \times 100 = 84.2\%$

Amount	5	15	10	83	97	Avg.
Percent (%)	2.4 %	7.1 %	4.8 %	39.5 %	46.2 %	83.88 Good

Source: Questionnaire results

Based on the results of the questionnaire given to 42 people who were taking care of Passports at the Class I TPI Makassar Immigration Office to get an overview of "Efficient Passport services using the M-Passport Application", the results of the questionnaire are as follows: The implementation of the M-Passport application for Passport services at the Class I TPI Makassar Immigration Office is optimal in achieving the Passport service target of 84.7% in the Good Category. Implementation of the M-Passport application for Passport services at the Class I TPI Makassar Immigration Office The procedure is easy to implement. 84.7% Good Category The implementation of the M-Passport application for Passport services at the Class I TPI Makassar Immigration Office has a very high success rate of 83% in the good category. The implementation of the M-Passport application for Passport services at the Class I TPI Makassar Immigration Office, the time used was relatively short (not long) 82.8% Good Category The implementation of the M-Passport application for Passport services at the Class I TPI Makassar Immigration Office, the costs incurred did not increase from the previous costs of 84.2% Good Category.

From the results of the questionnaire on "Efficient Passport services with the use of the M-Passport Application" although the average category of indicators shows the good category but still needs improvement towards the Very Good category. (90 -100%) on average the Efficient Passport service with the use of the M-Passport Application is only in the good category 83.88. Also, that requires attention and improvement based on the results of the questionnaire even though the category is good such as 1). The application of the M-Passport application for Passport services at the Class I TPI Makassar Immigration Office is optimal in achieving the objectives of Passport services, 2). The application of the M-Passport application for Passport services at the Class I TPI Makassar Immigration Office The procedure is easy to apply 3). The application of the M-Passport application for Passport services at the Class I TPI Makassar Immigration Office has a very high success rate, 4). The application of the M-Passport application for Passport services at the Class I TPI Makassar Immigration Office the time used is relatively short (not long) and 5). The application of the M-Passport application for Passport services at the Class I TPI Makassar Immigration Office the costs incurred do not increase from the previous costs. Of the 5 statements, 9.5% of informants stated that they disagreed and strongly disagreed with the statement that the M-Passport application is optimal in achieving its goals, the procedure is easy to implement, the success rate is very high, the time used is relatively short and the costs incurred do not increase.

Interview Results

Procedure Service

Procedure Passport services with the M-Passport application make it easy for the public to access, with This M- Passport application is a service Passport at Immigration Office Class I TPI Makassar will be faster because in the application explained grooves services and what are the requirements that must be met brought by the applicant passport so that service become directed. (results *Interview with Nur urlinda Alla (NRA) immigration document checking officer) on Friday, September 20, 2024 at 13.54 WITA at the Immigration Office Class I TPI Makassar.*

Procedure Service Passport make it easier for the community because can be directly uploaded via Playstore in the application the It states when to go to the Immigration Office and the requirements can be uploaded there, so all you have to do is come and bring the original documents (the results). *interview Akhsan Nizar (AKN) Head of Dakim Sub-section) Monday, September 23, 2024 at 16.45 WITA at the office Immigration Class I TPI Makassar.*

From the results NRA and AKN interviews were triangulated by Mr. Syamsul (SYM) that Passport service procedures with the M-Passport application provide convenience to applicants (community) because in the M- Passport Application; it is easily accessible, easy understood, clear directions on its features as well as the flow, is stated condition management Passport, schedule for come to office Immigration after Filling out the M- Passport as well as cost management passport. *(result interview Syamsul (SYM) Kasi Doklan) Wednesday, September 25, 2024 at 15.52 at the Immigration Office Class I TPI Makassar*

J service completion time figure

Term time settlement Passport No found in the M- Passport application because of M- Passport application dedicated just for registration only. So, term time settlement passport customized with results interview. Use The M-Passport application is actually to get a queue quota so when the applicant submits the application, they come according to the schedule selected in the application after successfully getting the quota, followed by payment, a billing code will be given. The time given is 1 hour for payment after the billing code is given.

After the applicant submits according to the selected schedule, they will be given a photo and interview queue so the stages until the photo and interview after the photo will be given 4 days to wait until it is finished so it is not at the same time. *(results Interview with Nur urlinda Alla (NRA) immigration document checking officer) on Friday, September 20, 2024 at 13.54 WITA at the Immigration Office Class I TPI Makassar.* The time period for using the M-Passport application is only for registration for the completion of the passport after the photo and interview are complete if the photo and interview have been uploaded, it can be continued to the location and printing is different, it is different between submitting a passport and the final completion of the passport. *(results of the interview with Akhsan Nizar (AKN) Head of Dakim Sub-section) Monday, September 23, 2024 at 16.45 WITA at the Class I TPI Makassar Immigration Office.*

NRA and AKN interviews and triangulated to SYM regarding the time period for completing Passport services varies. This is based on the results of photos and interviews. *(results of the interview with Syamsul (SYM) Kasi Doklan) Wednesday, September 25, 2024 at 15.52 at the Class I TPI Makassar Immigration Office.*

Passport Fees with M-Passport Application service prices

Cost payment There are already provisions and details and payments are made by transfer by the applicant through the M-Passport application so that there are no overpayments (extortion) the payments are detailed, and according to the clear rules and applicable to the M-Passport Application. *(results Interview with Nur urlinda Alla (NRA) immigration document checking officer) on Friday, September 20, 2024 at 13.54 WITA at the Immigration Office Class I TPI Makassar.*

This M-Passport application is very helpful in terms of payment because after filling out the M-Passport application, the applicant is given 1 hour to pay through the M-Passport Application so that the payment is easy and clear. *(results interview Akhsan Nizar (AKN) Head*

of Dakim Sub-section) Monday, September 23, 2024 at 16.45 WITA at the office Immigration Class I TPI Makassar.

Based on the results of interviews with NRA and AKN triangulated to SYM regarding the cost of Passport services through the M-Passport application, including the details specified during the service provision process, reasonable, detailed, and does not violate applicable regulations with the M-Passport application, the costs that must be paid by the applicant are listed and clearly detailed and easy to access the payment. *(results of interviews with Syamsul (SYM) Kasi Doklan) Wednesday, September 25, 2024 at 15.52 at the Class I TPI Makassar Immigration Office*

Service

Giving The service is very easy and more efficient because the applicant gets certainty of service and the applicant determines his own schedule and is sure to be served *(results Interview with Nur urlinda Alla (NRA) immigration document checking officer) on Friday, September 20, 2024 at 13.54 WITA at the Immigration Office Class I TPI Makassar.*

Service has been running according to SOP each section. Applicant can determine timetable myself. *(results interview Akhsan Nizar (AKN) Head of Dakim Sub-section) Monday, September 23, 2024 at 16.45 WITA at the office Immigration Class I TPI Makassar.*

Based on the results of interviews with NRA and AKN and triangulated to SYM regarding the service results of the M-Passport application, it is very satisfying, it has been running according to the SOP of each section and applicants get certainty of service and applicants determine their own schedules and are definitely served. *(results of interviews with Syamsul (SYM) Kasi Doklan) Wednesday, September 25, 2024 at 15.52 at the Class I TPI Makassar Immigration Office.*

Facilities and infrastructure

The facilities and infrastructure at the Class I TPI Makassar Immigration Office are appropriate with SOPs such as a waiting room with sofas, there is a breastfeeding room and a playroom for children as well cold room is ready and available space for passport applicant services for Indonesian and foreign citizens so that applicants are comfortable and not bored. Likewise, human resources already have Information Ambassadors and Service Ambassadors or guides who serve applicants who want to ask questions. *(results Interview with Nur urlinda Alla (NRA) immigration document checking officer) on Friday, September 20, 2024 at 13.54 WITA at the Immigration Office Class I TPI Makassar.*

The facilities and infrastructure at the Class I TPI Makassar Immigration Office are appropriate with SOP there is no buildup at the Immigration office in this case the rooms and facilities provided are available snack, place play for children, and availability counter service special carry-on age (elderly) and people with disabilities Disability. *(results interview Akhsan Nizar (AKN) Head of Dakim Sub-section) Monday, September 23, 2024 at 16.45 WITA at the office Immigration Class I TPI Makassar.*

Based on results interview with NRA and AKN as well triangulated to SYM about provision of facilities and infrastructure by service providers as well as comfort and convenience in using Passport services. That with M- Passport application depicted amount applicant passport Then customized with amount interviewer passport that will serve on the day That Because in accordance with available quota so in a way automatic means infrastructure the supporters are also already must available For give comfort and convenience in to obtain service passport as for applicant's infrastructure and facilities such as the waiting room equipped with sofas, there

is a breastfeeding room , a playroom for children , a passport applicant service counter for Indonesian and foreign citizens and availability counter special carry on Age (Elderly) and Disability as well as supported with there is Information Ambassadors and Service Ambassadors on duty as guide to serve applicants who want to ask questions. *(results interview Syamsul (SYM) Head of Documentation Section) Wednesday, September 25, 2024 at 15.52 at the Immigration Office Class I TPI Makassar.*

Obstacles faced in implementing the M-Passport application

Frequent obstacles occurs in the implementation M- Passport application is often there is a main t e n a n c e always updated always updated so at the time of Mantanance so that the applicant cannot access at that time so the applicant must wait another 2 to 3 days until the application is successful in the second maintenance related to the network. *(result Interview with Nur urlinda Alla (NRA) immigration document checking officer) on Friday, September 20, 2024 at 13.54 WITA at the Immigration Office Class I TPI Makassar.* obstacles at the time the use of the M-Passport application is usually occurs on the network and its full quota so that applicant No can access as well as do submission on the same day. *(results interview Akhsan Nizar (AKN) Head of Dakim Sub-section) Monday, September 23, 2024 at 16.45 WITA at the office Immigration Class I TPI Makassar.*

Based on results interview with NRA and AKN and triangulated to SYM about obstacles faced in implementing the M-Passport application. M - Passport Application always in Maintenance and always updated so that when Maintenance occurs the applicant cannot access it at that time the applicant passport must wait another 2 to 3 days until the application is successful in the second maintenance related to the network and the third sometimes No can follow desire applicant Because quota available it's already full, they must choose Where timetable the arrival that is still empty.

Implementation M- Passport application during the service process at the Class I TPI Makassar Immigration Office

The use of the M-Passport Application service at the Makassar Class I Immigration Office has the following characteristics; a). Passport service procedures with the M-Passport application provide convenience to applicants (the public) because the M-Passport Application; easy to access, easy to understand, clear instructions on its features and flows, b). The time for completing services through the M-Passport application, the completion of the Passport is in accordance with its stages. c). In the M-Passport application, the costs that must be paid by the applicant are stated and the details are clear and it is easy to access the payment. d). The M-Passport application service is very satisfactory according to the SOP of each section and the applicant gets certainty of service. e). With the M-Passport application, it has adequate facilities and infrastructure.

The M-Passport application at the Makassar Class I Immigration Office is in line with Riana Puspitasari's 2019 Theory that the Application 1). provides convenience, 2). Focuses on that technology itself, 3) Ease of technology, 4). easy to learn 5). easy to use and 6). has quality service

Convenience use defined as a level or condition Where somebody confident that by using certain systems do not require any effort *(free of effort)* or with words other technologies the can with easy understood by the user. Factors convenience use This related with How operational transact in a way online. Usually, potential consumers will experience difficulties when making their first transaction. on line, and tend cancel his intention Because no understand how to transact on line. In other party, there is Also candidate buyer Which very

take the initiative for try Because has get information on how to transact online. From the definition above, it can be concluded that the convenience uses in buy goods or service in a way on line very much important Because with the amount convenience Which given by seller on line so consumer can easier in interact and get information with easy as well as No make consumer Confused And to be not comfortable, so that later can keep the trust consumer.

Convenience Which leading on belief individual that usage system the No requires a lot of effort. These external factors are like system equipment designed for ease of use. One of the factors that causes users to accept or reject system is relatedness with use system. Users tend for use or not an application that is considered as something that they believe will help performance they in doing the job. The ease of using technology can help reduce a person's effort good time and also power, and easy get information in do booking on line. There is indicator from perception convenience according to Revelation (2016:1-10), that is No need cost, easy used, easy do What Which wanted, easy For Study operate, easy to do what you want, and interactions are clear and understandable. According to Dwi (2014:19-20), convenience usage is influenced by several factor, that is:

Good technology that is used continuously will provide convenience for user deep use it. Experience user on use technology kind of will give convenience user. A good reputation will be heard by consumers and will encourage consumer confidence. against ease-of-use technology that the Perception user to the technology has a reliable support mechanism, a trusted support mechanism. will make you feel comfortable and confident that there are supporting mechanisms that reliable if there are difficulties in using technology, then encourage users toward which are more positive.

There is a number of indicator convenience according to Yoganda (2017:2), that is: Easy to learn technology so that users can easily understand the device or application program. Easy-to-use technology to demonstrate the capabilities of the device or an application that is easy to operate and has other capabilities so that user feel comfortable when use it. Technology is easily available to users who want to use the device. or program on application the

According to Lupiyoadi (2013:216) explain quality service or service can defined as how much Far difference between fact and hope customer on service that they receive and the company's success in providing quality services to its customers, achieving high market share, and increasing the company's profits. is largely determined by the approach used. Service it is said quality if performance service can fulfil hope customers. Thus, there are two main factors that influence the quality of service, namely expected service (*expectation*) and service received (*performance*). If *performance* from service in accordance with expectations, so quality service perceived Good by customer, if performance from service beyond expectations, so quality service perceived as quality Which ideal. On the contrary, if *performance* from service is lower than *expectation*, then the quality of service is perceived as bad. So, either or poor quality of service of a company depends on the company's ability to consistently meet customer expectations. According to Hardiyansah (2011:46) For now quality service Which felt in a way real by consumers, there are indicators of service quality which are located in five dimensions of quality service, that is: In the form of (*Tangible*), Which own indicator quality interior, quality exterior, comfort of the vehicle used, cleanliness of the driver, completeness of the facilities transportation, and neatness driver. Empathy, has indicators of the driver's ability to communicate, friendliness driver, driver's ability to understand passenger needs, and manners driver. Reliability, has an indicator of passenger trust in the quality of service, driver No differentiate service Which given to passenger, And accuracy of service driver to passenger. Power responsive (*Responsiveness*), own indicator driver fast responsive in responding to

passenger complaints, clarity information about grab, drivers have knowledge for answer question passenger, and initiative driver in give service on passengers Assurance, has an indicator of the accuracy of service schedules for passengers, security in journey, guarantee safety, And belief passenger on quality.

Implementation of the M-Passport application to improve the effectiveness and efficiency of the service process at the Class I TPI Makassar Immigration Office

In line with the theory of effectiveness of the M-Passport Application Effectiveness is the achievement of the goals of a program or organization through the efficient use of available resources. This is reviewed from the input, process, and output sides. Quoted from the UIN Suska repository, the following are the criteria for effectiveness or something being said to be effective, and the M-Passport is also effective because. Clarity of the goals to be achieved. Clarity of strategy for achieving goals. A solid process of analysis and policy formulation. Careful planning. Proper program planning in a plan. Availability of work facilities and infrastructure. Effective and efficient implementation. An educational supervision system.

According to Richard M. Steers, in Seville 2022 here are some measures of effectiveness: Goal achievement is the whole effort to achieve the goal must be viewed as a process. In order for the goal to be achieved, it is necessary to stage the achievement of each part. Integration is a measurement of the level of capability of a program towards the process that carries socialization. Starting from socialization to communication. Adaptation is the ability of an institution or program to adjust to its environment. Therefore, it is important to determine the benchmark of the procurement process.

In addition to fulfilling element Effectiveness M- Passport Application Also. Mahmudi in Sevilla 2022 defines efficiency as a process undertaken to compare and measure inputs and outputs, or measure the comparison between the results achieved against the resources and efforts used. Meanwhile, Mulyamah in Sevilla 2022 defines efficiency as a measure used when comparing the planned use of a resource as an input, with the actual use or in other words the realized use.

From all the above understandings, it can be concluded that efficiency is a comparison between the resources used in a process of doing business or work, with the results achieved. The fewer resources used, such as manpower, time, and costs, but can still produce *output* according to plan or expectations, then it will be considered more efficient.

After Grameds understand the basic understanding of efficiency, the next thing to discuss is how the concept of efficiency actually works in the processes carried out in various fields. Check out the explanation below. In general, something will be said to be efficient if no resources are wasted in carrying out the process, or it can be said to optimize everything. In some fields, the term efficiency can be used in various ways that provide an overview of various optimization processes. Below are some fields that are related to the term efficiency in their processes.

Operational efficiency is an effort to measure how well the profit is obtained as a function of operational costs. The greater the operational efficiency, the more profitable the company or investment will be. This can happen because the entity is able to utilize the same or even lower costs than the alternative, and still generate greater returns or income. In financial markets, operational efficiency is said to occur if costs and transaction costs are reduced. Economic efficiency refers to the effort to optimize resources to serve everyone as best as possible, given the prevailing economic conditions. There is no set benchmark for determining the effectiveness of an economy, but there are indicators of economic efficiency that include

products brought to market at the lowest cost, and workers who are able to provide the highest output.

After getting to know more about efficiency, Grameds must have known that efficiency has various benefits. To clarify further, below will be explained some of the benefits of efficiency. Reducing or saving resources in carrying out an activity. Utilize all available resources as much as possible so that nothing is wasted. Achieving a goal or result that is in accordance with plans or expectations. Allows for optimal results or maximum profits. Improve the work performance of a unit, so that the output produced is maximized. Allows a person to be more productive in less time

Obstacles faced in implementation M- Passport application at the Immigration Office Class I TPI Makassar?

The obstacles faced in implementing the M-Passport application are: The M-Passport application must always be maintained and always updated, so when maintenance is in progress, applicants cannot access the M-Passport application service. At that time, passport applicants must wait another 2 to 3 days until the application is successfully maintained. both are related to the network The problem is that the application cannot be accessed. Thirdly, sometimes they cannot follow the applicant's wishes because the available quota is full, so they have to choose where the arrival schedule is still empty.

The results of this study are in line With Study Sari (2020) “H arriers Midwife in Use Application THE BEAUTIFUL *The Midwife Obstacles in The Usage of SI BEAUTIFUL Applications*” In study This, obstacle use application SI BEAUTIFUL Which No due to by weakness application classified between other Because: the bad connection Internet, patient No bring card identity, And The midwife forgot to input data into the SI CANTIK application. While the obstacles to using the SI CANTIK application caused by application weaknesses are classified as including: difficult data input process, *login* process difficult, question too Lots, data No integrated, and use who spends long time.

Table 3. Distribution Frequency Classification Obstacle Use Application SI BEAUTIFUL in Region Work 8 District Health Center Sidoarjo Year 2019

Classification Obstacle Use Application SI BEAUTIFUL	N	%
No Hampered	4	12.5
The bad thing Connection Internet	4	12.5
Patient Not Carrying Card Identity	3	9.4
Midwife Forget Input Data	2	6.3
Process Data Input Difficult	4	12.5
Process Login Difficult	4	12.5
Question Too Lots	3	9.4
Data No Integrated	2	6.3
Use use up Time Long	6	18.8
Total	32	100.0

Influence network in application A M- Passport Application it turns out something found on other Apps like Si Cantik in Region Work 8 District Health Center Sidoarjo Year 2019. But For M- Passport application have excess Included in the application That Alone such as difficult login process but on the M- Passport application login easier and simpler to access.

Repositioning Bureaucratic Legitimacy through Mobile Public Service Reform

One should not consider a seamlessly stolen idea of the M-Passport application being added to the infrastructure of Indonesia's immigration service because it is an entirely different form of active transformation of an old bureaucratic way of relating to people in the era of digitalization. What we are likely to see in this study is not only that a system works, but that a trust and an efficiency and a state legitimacy are being rewritten on the mobile platforms. The rhetoric of digital governance should thus cease being about administrative convenience and address political, ethical, and social implications of it. Such repositioning demands that we view the M-Passport platform as both an administrative resource, but as a symbolic and operational channel of transmission through which the state achieves its visibility and responsiveness. In recent years, scholarly commentary cautioned quantifying the potential of digitization too extensively without allowing users to understand how they might want to be treated fairly, non-exclusively, and accountably in digital systems. Within this report, the vital factor grassroots that determines the legitimacy of systems as Alajmi (2022) have implied through their longitudinal study on m-government in East Asian countries reasoned, is procedural integrity, as opposed to speed as a determinant of legitimacy. Its implication is far-reaching implying that the effectiveness can never be taken out of the discourse of democratic service delivery.

Simultaneously, M-Passport platform requires us to redefine the architecture of bureaucratic rationality. The established forms of the public administration saw discretion was vested with civil servants whose power was entrenched in institutional routines. It is through digital interfaces that such a discretion is transferred to algorithms and interface logic thus changing the control balance in encounters when people need to access a public service. What we have out of the data of this study is a paradox. On the one hand, the application makes the process less subjective and faster, and on the other hand, it deprives an applicant of agency, organizing his actions within the limited concept of its procedures. This reflects the conclusions by Lekkas & Souitaris (2023) who believed that m-government platforms tend to instantiate what they refer to as codified compliance regimes that do not allow much dialogical negotiation between a citizen and a bureaucrat. Once the interface acts as a determinant of eligibility and deadline, the statistics between the applicant and the state will deteriorate to a series of un-negotiable instructions. This begs the question of whether efficiency in the digital field is being found through the loss of institutional empathy something that is not omitted in the realm of a service-based industry as delicate and identity-centered as immigration.

What is also becoming so urgent to solve, is the increasing contradiction between structural inequality and digital optimization. Makassar case, though in context a success story, is an eye opener regarding the distribution of the gains of the mobile system among the users. Smartphone, reliable Internet, and digital literacy are preconditions that are not achieved across all demographic and socioeconomic lines. In a study by Priyadharma (2024) regarding rural digital exclusion in Southeast Asia, the researchers found that the most expertly planned platforms will not work for marginalized groups in the case of insufficient infrastructure that does not facilitate equal access. The interface of the M-Passport application, which has been strong and taken well in urban areas, is, however, still subject to the replication of this gap. The inefficiency created by the system is unfairly transferred to those who find it most difficult to seek an alternative route, when applicants face network malfunctions or unannounced system down time and when the quota on appointments has been reached. With this regard, the concept of efficiency should not solely be defined as the ratio of time to output but as an ethical notion of fair accessibility, which has been designated by Lucas et al. (2016) in their works on studying the forms of governance of digital public services.

The contributions of human infrastructure to the M-Passport service eco-system cannot be left to the background. The complexity and the vastness of the service legwork being done by the platform does not imply that service ambassadors, intelligible signage, open lounges, and help counters in case of weak users are mere window dressing as they form part and parcel of exposing to service. Digital platforms, as the new research by Brousseau et al. (2011) has demonstrated, do not substitute the institutional body, but they expand it. Human mediation, especially by the first-time user or the first-time applicant who needs some explanations, make it so that technological abstraction does not turn into an obstacle. There is nothing merely operationally convenient then, in the investment on the part of the Makassar Immigration office in physical comfort and guided assistance. According to it, the delivery of outcomes is not always that big a part of public service, but it is rather about creating relational spaces where individuals feel understood and being served. This complies with the claims of Polzer & Goncharenko (2022), who states that digital trust will not happen as a result of app design and requires co-production by hybrid infrastructures of care.

Just as well, the results of the study encourage us to reconsider the way we measure performance and understand its interpretation. Although the scores of effectiveness and efficiency provide quantitative confirmation of the success of a system, they should be put in a broader evaluation context. Likewise, when a system is rated as good by a majority, what would it imply when a minority would gain a lot of friction nonetheless? When 15 percent of applicants do not get their preferred appointment schedule because of quota restrictions, or because of scheduled plant maintenance, are those outliers acceptable, or indicative of the outside limits of the Design logic of the day? Omodan (2024) make a convincing argument that digital infrastructures should not remain as naked service script, but transform to a dynamic learning space. In the M-Passport context, it implies feeding the development loop with the real-time feedback and usage analytics, as well as complaint patterns. In absence of such reflexivity, even technically best platforms are at the risk of being exposed at the peril of becoming socially outdated. The inference is all too obvious: administrative success of an administrative success is no longer a mere matter of how many, but whether the numbers worry over lived complexity.

The other significant strata of this argument would be in relation to the symbolic strength of automation in the state-citizen relations. Human arbiters could allow some flexibility of interpretation in the traditional bureaucracies. Digital interfaces, however, are based on fidelity. Improper data input, low quality picture upload of any document, or misinterpreted guidelines regularly amount to automatic disqualification that can be discussed as impersonal or even disciplinary. This can undermine the confidence of citizens in the digital rejection machines when they are depersonalized, as indicated in the study conducted by Bowers (2016) on Chinese e-services. The M-Passport site has achieved a laudable profile in providing ordered procedures, yet as the interview data of this study indicates, applicants continue to be confronted with a faceless procedure in instances when things go wrong. Lack of immediate feedback loops, windows of clarification or mechanisms of appeals leaves the users in a vacuum, of interpetation, unable to identify the cause of failure and postponing resolution. This design defect is no longer merely technical, it is becomes democratic.

Lastly, there is the institutional long-term implication of the mobile based service delivery. Applications such as M-Passport are not only the remedy to the bottlenecks of the present time, but they are also defining how government will operate in years to come. Instead of feeling the state mainly as a set of buildings, officials, and printed forms, it is now perceived as an app, as a screen, and as a reminder in the calendar. Quite literally, as Pors (2015) have found necessary to argue, this shift to mobile bureaucracy also transforms the phenomenology of the very

process of public administration. The ability to manipulate the public record, daily life and conduct is becoming concentrated, more and more, in the codebase of digital systems. This moves governance into an anticipative online-based data-driven system. This transition may result in a greater or a lesser empowerment of the public depending on whether the systems are open to reform, are inclusive in design and are responsive to the plurality of the need in the population. There are more optimistic tendencies on the results of the Makassar implementation based on results being optimistic. There is the infrastructure, the institutional will is in the process of being revealed, and the user reaction is overall favorable. But optimism should not be mistaken with definiteness. Digital transformation does not stop at the public sector; digital transformation is an endless bargaining process between technology, society and the developing relationship between the state and that population.

Conclusion

The adoption of M-Passport application at the Makassar Class I TPI Immigration Office is much more than an increment to process, rather a paradigmatic shift in the way that the legitimacy, responsiveness and inclusivity of a public institution is discursively constructed in the digital era. Although the numerical measures of effectiveness and efficiency indicate that the operations are effective and efficient, this measure reflects very little about the reality on the ground. Behind those scores there can be a highly entangled relation between institutional design, technological mediation, and citizen experience. The paper shows that digital governance has the potential to redesign the process of delivery of public services as it becomes more immediate, convenient, and less degrading when appropriately supported by infrastructural considerations and procedural clarity. But it also illustrates the weaknesses that lie behind such systems, the infrastructural instability, the formulaic rigidity, the risks they impose of exclusion, that have to be proactively and constantly addressed.

In this study, we have seen that mobile platforms, such as the M-Passport, are not disengaged tools; they themselves are influenced and in-vitro by their institutional cultures. These properties (The possibility of decentralization of scheduling, standardization of documentation, and transparency of costs) that are capabilities of the described platform prove that where digital systems are synonymous with human-centered design principles, the future of administrative effectiveness, as well as user agency, can be more efficiently achieved. But in order to say whether the technology is successful or not it is impossible to assess this point isolatedly. It should be measured in the larger ecology of trust between bureaucracies, access to services and equity in infrastructures. Success of the continued implementation of the M-Passport application lies in the strategic account of integration of the digital logic into the application without negating procedural empathy or exception responsiveness. Its sustainability will be conditional upon the fact of whether it will develop into the platform that serves, listens and learns. The study enhances an academic area of agreement that the path ahead of digital governance involves not only speed, but also reflexivity. Public service softwares should also be constructed not only to work, but to evolve, to answer to the multiplicity of users and to assuage failures in institutional style. Makassar experience confirms that innovation is possible in resource limited settings when institutional preparedness, user orientation, and investment in infrastructures are available. However, the future will require more than copying. It requires dialogues between system and society, between policy and practice and between citizens and the developing interfaces of the state.

The M-Passport platform is a synonym of the progress, as well as a reminder of unreceived efforts. It confirms that the public sector of Indonesia can reinvent itself audaciously on the digital frontier but wants us to remember that technology never replaces governance it is merely

assistant that demonstrates its honesty. The problem is now how to go beyond implementation to the project of transformation- whereby digital systems become more than efficient, becoming ethical, inclusive, and the producers of democratic trust. The story of M-Passport is not complete. It is a threshold a beginning from which a more equitable and responsive digital bureaucracy can be imagined and realized.

References

- Agustina, A. (2022). Tinjauan Hukum Terhadap Peningkatan Pelayanan Paspor Ri Di Era Digital Pada Kantor Imigrasi Kelas Ia Tpi (Tempat Pemeriksaan Imigrasi) SAMARINDA. *Journal of Law (Jurnal Ilmu Hukum)*, 8(1), 340-350.
- Alajmi, M. (2022). *Using a multi-framework to investigate the determinants of smart government systems adoption in public service organizations in Saudi Arabia* (Doctoral dissertation, University of Canberra).
- Anwary, I. (2023). Exploring the Interconnectedness Between Public Administration, Legislative Systems, and Criminal Justice: A Comparative Analysis of Malaysia and Indonesia. *International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*, 18(1), 172-182.
- Azzam, F., Jaber, M., Saies, A., Kirresh, T., Awadallah, R., Karakra, A., ... & Amarneh, S. (2023). The use of blockchain technology and OCR in e-government for document management: Inbound invoice management as an example. *Applied Sciences*, 13(14), 8463. <https://doi.org/10.3390/app13148463>
- Beňuška, T., & Nečas, P. (2021). On societal security of the state: applying a perspective of sustainability to immigration. *Entrepreneurship and Sustainability Issues*, 9(2), 473. [http://dx.doi.org/10.9770/jesi.2021.9.2\(31\)](http://dx.doi.org/10.9770/jesi.2021.9.2(31))
- Bloch, A., & Silva, M. A. R. (2011). Undocumented immigration between the US and Mexico: the complex development of militarized borders and social responses. *Crossing and Controlling Borders*, 159.
- Bowers, C. A. (2016). *Digital detachment: How computer culture undermines democracy*. Routledge.
- Brousseau, E., Garrouste, P., & Raynaud, E. (2011). Institutional changes: Alternative theories and consequences for institutional design. *Journal of Economic Behavior & Organization*, 79(1-2), 3-19. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jebo.2011.01.024>
- Cahyono, P. (2024). The Effect of E-Government-Based Public Service Innovation (M-Passport) And Employee Capability on Public Satisfaction Mediated By Trust. *Jurnal Ad'ministrare*, 192-200.
- Chatti, W. (2021). Moving towards environmental sustainability: information and communication technology (ICT), freight transport, and CO2 emissions. *Heliyon*, 7(10). <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.heliyon.2021.e08190>
- Engkus, E. (2023). Enhancing public services in the West Java provincial government: Unraveling challenges, defining essence, and proposing solutions. *Journal of Current Social and Political Issues*, 1(2), 54-61. <https://doi.org/10.15575/jcspi.v1i2.475>
- Fawzi, S. (2022). The impact of ethnic groups on national security. *Future Journal of Social Science*, 1(2), 1-17.

- Firman, F., Sahrul, S., & Ramadoan, S. (2023). Analysis of efforts in the development of local government: e-government and public service management. *Jurnal Studi Ilmu Pemerintahan*, 4(2), 25-36. <https://doi.org/10.35326/jsip.v4i2.3465>
- Fitri, F., Nazaki, N., & Yudhanto, S. A. (2023). *Inovasi Pelayanan Paspor Online Melalui Aplikasi M-Paspor Di Kantor Imigrasi Kelas 1 Tanjungpinang* (Doctoral dissertation, Universitas Maritim Raja Ali Haji).
- Gebremedhin, T. A., & Mavisakalyan, A. (2023). Immigration and political stability. [*Judul jurnal atau penerbit*]. (Lengkapi dengan informasi publikasi jika ada)
- Izzaturrahmah, N., & Saputro, M. N. C. E. (2024). Revolutionizing Passport Services with M-Passport: Towards Agile and Digital Government. *Agile Governance and Innovation Measurement Journal*, 1(1), 12-21. <http://dx.doi.org/10.18196/agimjournal.v1i1.9>
- Kim, J., & Lim, C. (2021). Customer complaints monitoring with customer review data analytics: An integrated method of sentiment and statistical process control analyses. *Advanced Engineering Informatics*, 49, 101304. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.aei.2021.101304>
- Kipingu, M. K., & Shayo, D. P. (2021). Technology and immigration system: A new paradigm for improving government service delivery in Tanzania. *PanAfrican Journal of Governance and Development (PJGD)*, 2(2), 81-106. <http://dx.doi.org/10.46404/panjogov.v2i2.3231>
- Lekkas, C. K., & Souitaris, V. (2023). Bureaucracy meets digital reality: The unfolding of urban platforms in European municipal governments. *Organization Studies*, 44(10), 1649-1678. <https://doi.org/10.1177/01708406221130857>
- Lestari, D. P. (2024, October). User-Centered Interaction Design for Indonesia's E-Government Passport Application: The M-Paspor Indonesia Case Study. In *2024 IEEE International Conference on Data and Software Engineering (ICoDSE)* (pp. 235-240). IEEE. <https://doi.org/10.1109/ICoDSE63307.2024.10829902>
- Lucas, K., Van Wee, B., & Maat, K. (2016). A method to evaluate equitable accessibility: combining ethical theories and accessibility-based approaches. *Transportation*, 43(3), 473-490. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jebo.2011.01.024>
- Matlala, M. E., & Maphoto, A. R. (2022). Management of electronic records in the South African public sector. *ESARBICA journal: journal of the eastern and southern africa regional branch of the international council on archives*, 41, 69-88.
- Milakovich, M. E. (2021). *Digital governance: Applying advanced technologies to improve public service*. Routledge.
- Mwamure, A. N. (2013). *Effect of information and communications technology supported operations on service quality at the department of immigration, Kenya* (Doctoral dissertation, University of Nairobi).
- Ngoc, N. M., & Tien, N. H. (2023). Quality of scientific research and world ranking of public and private universities in Vietnam. *International journal of public sector performance management*, 10(1), 1-15.
- Nurkumalawati, I., & Salsha, N. D. (2023). Evaluation of M-Paspor application in Indonesia: M-government concept perspective. *Journal of Social and Political Sciences*, 6(4). <https://doi.org/10.31014/aior.1991.06.04.459>

- Omodan, B. I. (2024). Redefining university infrastructure for the 21st century: An interplay between physical assets and digital evolution. *Journal of Infrastructure, Policy and Development*, 8(4), 3468. <http://dx.doi.org/10.24294/jipd.v8i4.3468>
- Polzer, T., & Goncharenko, G. (2022). The UK COVID-19 app: The failed co-production of a digital public service. *Financial Accountability & Management*, 38(2), 281-298. <https://doi.org/10.1111/faam.12307>
- Pors, A. S. (2015). Becoming digital—passages to service in the digitized bureaucracy. *Journal of Organizational Ethnography*, 4(2), 177-192. <https://doi.org/10.1108/JOE-08-2014-0031>
- Prameswari, N. M. (2022, June). Implementation Good Governance in Public Service Immigration in Service Passport Making. In *Proceeding of The International Conference of Inovation, Science, Technology, Education, Children, and Health* (Vol. 2, No. 1, pp. 216-224). <https://doi.org/10.62951/icistech.v2i1.115>
- Priyadharma, S. (2024). “Periphery-Centric” Approach as a Tactic for Everyday Digital In-and Exclusion of Indonesian Villages. *Media and Communication*, 12.
- Rabbani, M. A. H. E. S. W. A. R. A., & Fajar, A. N. (2024). A Comprehensive Examination Of User Satisfaction In Indonesian Passport Services: Insights From The M-Paspor Application. *Article in Journal of Theoretical and Applied Information Technology*, 15(5).
- Rane, N., Choudhary, S., & Rane, J. (2024). Gemini versus ChatGPT: applications, performance, architecture, capabilities, and implementation. *Journal of Applied Artificial Intelligence*, 5(1), 69-93. <http://dx.doi.org/10.48185/jaai.v5i1.1052>
- Sari, E. F. (2020). Hambatan Bidang dalam Penggunaan Aplikasi SI CANTIK. *Media Gizi Kesmas*, 9(2), 41-47.
- Setiyani, L., & Tjandra, E. (2022). UI/UX design model for student complaint handling application using design thinking method (Case Study: STMIK Rosma Karawang). *International Journal of Science, Technology & Management*, 3(3), 690-702. <http://dx.doi.org/10.46729/ijstm.v3i3.505>
- Sevilla. (2022). Efisiensi: Pengertian, jenis, konsep, manfaat, dan tolak ukurnya. *Gramdia Blog*.
- Tampi, P. P., Nabella, S. D., & Sari, D. P. (2022). The influence of information technology users, employee empowerment, and work culture on employee performance at the Ministry of Law and Human Rights Regional Office of Riau Islands. *Enrichment: Journal of Management*, 12(3), 1620-1628. <https://doi.org/10.35335/enrichment.v12i3.628>
- Turner, M., Prasojo, E., & Sumarwono, R. (2022). The challenge of reforming big bureaucracy in Indonesia. *Policy Studies*, 43(2), 333-351. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01442872.2019.1708301>
- Val, I., Seijo, Ó., Torrego, R., & Astarloa, A. (2021). IEEE 802.1 AS clock synchronization performance evaluation of an integrated wired–wireless TSN architecture. *IEEE Transactions on Industrial Informatics*, 18(5), 2986-2999. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1109/TII.2021.3106568>

- Watini, S., Nurhaeni, T., & Meria, L. (2021). Development of village office service models to community based on mobile computing. *International Journal of Cyber and IT Service Management*, 1(2), 189-196. <http://dx.doi.org/10.34306/ijcitsm.v1i2.51>
- Wulandari, F. A., Ismail, & Prasetijowati, T. (2023). Analisa kualitas pelayanan pengurusan paspor melalui M-Paspor dalam rangka penyederhanaan layanan di Kantor Imigrasi Kelas I Khusus TPI Surabaya. *Jurnal Ilmiah Muqoddimah: Jurnal Ilmu Sosial, Politik dan Humaniora*, 7(3), 804–808.